

CONFERENCE REPORT

WEST AFRICA HIGH-LEVEL CONFERENCE ON INEQUALITIES AND NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

August 17 to 19 2022



ORGANIZERS
FORD FOUNDATION



PARTNERS



WEST AFRICA HIGH-LEVEL CONFERENCE ON INEQUALITIES AND NATURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT



ALISA HOTEL, ACCRA GHANA
17TH To 19TH AUGUST 2022

CONFERENCE REPORT

Contents

Acronyms	iii
1.0 BACKGROUND:.....	1
2.0 OPENING STATEMENTS:.....	1
2.1 National Development Planning Commission	1
2.2 Ford Foundation.....	2
2.3 African Minerals Development Centre (AMDC).....	2
2.4 Publish What You Pay (PWYP)	3
2.5 Statement By Director General, National Development Planning Commission, Ghana	3
3.0 CONFERENCE PAPERS	4
3.1 PAPER 1: INEQUALITIES AND NATURAL RESOURCES GOVERNANCE: A BROAD WEST AFRICAN PICTURE.....	4
3.2 QUESTIONS AND CONTRIBUTIONS ON PAPER 1.....	7
3.2.1 CONTRIBUTIONS ON PAPER 1:.....	9
3.3 PAPER 2: POLITICAL ECONOMY OF EXTRACTIVISM:	9
3.3.1 The Political Economy of Natural Resource Governance and Inequalities in West Africa	9
3.3.2 KEY TAKEAWAYS FROM DAY ONE:.....	14
3.4 PAPER 3: ECONOMIC GOVERNANCE, NATURAL RESOURCES, AND INEQUALITIES.....	15
3.4.1 NATURAL RESOURCES AND INEQUALITY IN WEST AFRICA.....	15
3.5 .PAPER 4: FEMINIST PERSPECTIVE ON EXTRACTIVISM IN WEST AFRICA	20
3.5.1 GENDER JUSTICE & EXTRACTIVISM IN WEST AFRICA: WHAT ARE FEMINIST GROUPS SAYING & DOING ABOUT IT?	20
3.6 ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY AND RESOURCE GOVERNANCE	26
3.6.1 PAPER 1: LINKAGES BETWEEN EXTRACTIVES, ENVIRONMENTAL DAMAGE, & INEQUALITIES IN THE ECOWAS REGION	26
3.7 PAPER 2: PROSPECTS FOR ACHIEVING EQUITABLE ENERGY TRANSITIONS IN WEST AFRICA	30
3.8 PAPER 3: NATURAL RESOURCES AND EQUITABLE ENERGY TRANSITION IN WEST AFRICA: INSIGHTS FROM GHANA, NIGERIA, SIERRA LEONE, BURKINA FASO, AND SENEGAL.....	31
3.8.1 1ST DISCUSSANT – Policy Lead for Petroleum and Conversational Energy - African Centre for Energy Policy	33
3.8.2 2ND DISCUSSANT – Policy Analyst and Communication Strategist, ISODEC	34
3.8.3 QUESTIONS AND CONTRIBUTIONS	36
4.0 COUNTRY CASE STUDIES:.....	38
4.1 NATURAL RESOURCES AND VIOLENT EXTREMISM IN THE SAHEL AND ON THE AFRICAN WEST COAST, THE CASE OF BURKINA FASO By Mr. Mamadou Karama	38
4.1.1 DISCUSSANT: Hon Emmanuel Bombande – Conflict Resolution and Peace Activist & Founder of WANEP	40

4.2	NIGERIA CASE STUDY: FUELING THE WORLD, FAILING THE PEOPLE; ENERGY POLICIES, ENERGY POVERTY AND ENERGY TRANSITION IN NIGERIA	43
4.3	GHANA CASE STUDY: IN WHAT WAY IS GHANA’S MANAGEMENT OF ITS NATURAL RESOURCES EXACERBATING OR HELPING TO REDUCE INEQUALITIES?.....	44
4.4	A CASE STUDY OF SIERRA LEONE; NATURAL RESOURCE EXTRACTION AND INEQUALITY	46
4.4.1	QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS.....	47
4.4.2	CONTRIBUTIONS	49
4.5	NORTHERN GHANA EXPERIENCE: DEALING WITH SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC INEQUALITIES IN MINING COMMUNITIES. THE CASE OF NORTHERN GHANA.....	50
4.5.1	A CASE OF THE SONGOR LAGOON – A SALT RICH COMMUNITY Nene Dadebom Anim II -Chief of Salom, Ada West District, Ada Songor Lagoon Association Songor Lagoon.	52
5.0	HOW DO SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC INEQUALITIES MANIFEST THEMSELVES IN MINING COMMUNITIES AND HOW HAVE COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS CONFRONTED THESE IN WEST AFRICA AND BEYOND?.....	53
5.1.1	QUESTIONS AND CONTRIBUTIONS	54
5.1.2	CONTRIBUTIONS:	56
5.2	Chairperson’s Closing Remarks – Pauline?	58
6.0	THE MEDIA, SOCIAL JUSTICE AND THE EXTRACTIVE INDUSTRY IN GHANA.	58
6.1.1	Contributions and Questions	64
7.0	CONFERENCE TAKEAWAYS.....	66
7.1	Professor Aliyu Jauro - Director General, National Environmental Standards and Regulations Enforcement Agency, Nigeria	66
7.2	Lumun Amanda Feese – Technical Advisor, Strategy & Governance, MinDiver	67
7.3	Dr. Winfred Nelson – National Development Planning Commission, Ghana	69
8.0	APPENDICES	71
8.1	Appendix I – Program for the Conference	71
8.2	Appendix II - List of Participants	73
8.2.1	IN-Country Participants.....	73
8.2.2	Out-Country Participants	75

Acronyms

AMDC	-	African Minerals Development Centre
AMV	-	African Mining Vision
ARHR	-	Alliance for Reproductive Health Rights
ASM	-	Artisanal and small-scale Mining
AU	-	African Union
BIT	-	Bilateral Investment Treaty
CDA	-	Community Development Agreement
CSO	-	Civil Society Organization
DFID	-	Department for International Development
ECOWAS	-	Economic Community of West African States
EI	-	Extractive Industry
EIA	-	Environmental Impact Assessment
EITI	-	Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative
EMDP	-	Energy and Mineral Development program
EPA	-	Environmental Protection Agency
ESG	-	Environment, Social and Governance
ESIA	-	Environmental and Social Impact Assessment
FPIC	-	Free, Prior and Informed Consent
GDP	-	Gross Domestic Product
IFC	-	International Finance Corporation
IMF	-	International Monetary Funds
ISDS	-	Investor-State Dispute Settlement
ISODEC	-	Integrated Social Development Centre
LGA	-	Local Government Area
LNG	-	Liquefied Natural Gas
LPG	-	Liquefied Petroleum Gas
MAHB	-	Millennium Alliance for Humanity and Biosphere
MPI	-	Multidimensional Poverty Index
MT	-	Metric Ton
NDC	-	National Democratic Congress
NDPC	-	National Development Planning Commission
NEITI	-	Nigeria Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative

NESG	-	Nigerian Economic Summit Group
NGO	-	Non-Governmental Organization
NPP	-	New Patriotic Party
NRG	-	National Reference Group
OPEC	-	Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries
PNDC	-	Provisional National Defense Council
PS	-	Performance Standards
PV	-	Photovoltaics
PWC	-	Price Waterhouse Coopers
PWYP	-	Publish What You Pay
REDD	-	Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and forest Degradation
SADC	-	Southern African Development Community
SDG	-	Sustainable Development Goal
TAMA	-	The Foundation for the Transformation of Marginal Areas
UDS	-	University of Development Studies
UK	-	United Kingdom
UN	-	United Nation
USAID	-	United States Agency for International Development
VAT	-	Value Added Tax
VAW	-	Violence Against Women
WAMO	-	Workforce, Administration, Management and Organization System
WANEP	-	West Africa Network for Peacebuilding

1.0 BACKGROUND

This high-level conference was organized under the theme: **Natural Resource Governance and Inequalities in West Africa**. The Conference convened development practitioners, academics, policymakers and think tanks across West Africa to discuss, brainstorm on the nexus between natural resource management and inequality in West Africa and how these impact on populations and the environment and its implications for addressing poverty and inequalities in West Africa. It also explored strategies to address these inflicting issues at policy and operational level by drawing from country-level experiences among others. Targeting five countries, participants were mainly drawn from Ghana, Sierra Leone, Senegal, Burkina Faso and Nigeria.

Several technical papers and country case studies were presented to provide the context and platform for discussions with specialist discussants and participants, including virtual presenters and participants.

This report therefore captures the entire workshop proceedings. The conference sought,

1. To bring visibility to policymakers in select ECOWAS countries of the nexus between natural resource dependence and multiple inequalities in the West Africa Region.
2. To seek better understanding and contribute to knowledge, of how the two relate and measures to enhance equitable and green development through natural resource management in the West African context.
3. To highlight policy pathways for the attainment of SDG 10 through better natural resource management.
4. To stimulate alliances, coalitions, and networking on the commitment to addressing inequalities generally, and the role of natural resource governance in this endeavour and facilitate their sustained engagement on the issues beyond the conference through rotational annual convenings across the region.

2.0 OPENING STATEMENTS

The following were the opening statements to set the stage for the commencement of the Conference:

2.1 National Development Planning Commission

Dr. Wilfred Nelson

The constitution of Ghana is the highest law in Ghana, and it recognizes the need for and importance of dealing with preserving all natural resources in the country and using natural resources sustainably. In this regard, all natural resources in Ghana belong to the State, whether it is on an individual or family land. As a nation, we are interested in ensuring that issues concerning natural resources are mainstreamed into National Development Planning and Budgeting processes.

This is not surprising as to why there are a number of laws and policies in this field, which sometimes overlap. A lot of effort has been made in this area and because of the critical importance of natural resources, Government seeks to partner with NGOs, private sector organisations, civil society organisations, international organisations, etc. to ensure that the best is gotten out of Ghana's natural resources.

There are issues of inequalities with varied opinions. Several factors lead to these inequalities, but what is critical is the contribution of natural resources and how it influences and aggravates or also reduces these inequalities, which is the reason for this conference.

There are also similar issues in the other West African countries in relation to dealing with mining and natural resources and the inequality question. These issues include gender, social issues, income, and economic among others. On behalf of the Ghana National Development Planning Commission, we wish you a warm welcome.

2.2 Ford Foundation

Dr. Chichi Aniagolu, Regional Director

It is great that the discussions at this conference are regionally based as opposed to country-based; the reason being that many of the issues we face as a country can be better resolved if we have a conversation across countries. They are similar and we can do a lot more together. From the perspective of inequality, we are a rich region of poor people. **How did we get here?** As Africans, we have gone through many iterations: pre-colonial Africa had such a harmonious relationship with nature that, we worshipped the earth, the rivers, and the trees. For example, the precolonial history of an Island I visited recently indicated that they buried their dead in trees, which is an example of how nature was preserved because they were seen as sacred as their ancestors were in them.

Then came colonialism and its exploitation and we moved from being people who worshipped the earth to people who became violent exploiters of the earth not by any choice of ours. Fortunately, the colonial legacy is what has continued. That exploitation of the earth without paying attention to what it means for us as people and our environment and of course, the earth itself has begun to violently “fight for itself” which is why we are having climate change and all sorts of disasters along the way.

This conference is important because we are here to ask and answer important questions which are:

- How can we learn from our history so that we don't repeat the mistakes of that history?
- We are at the best time, which is now, so how do we ensure that the resources that we have as people work for us in ways that reduce inequalities?
- How do we ensure that our wealth works for everyone?

There are enough resources, but how can we as policymakers, practitioners, and researchers, begin to focus on how we can have a wealthy nation of wealthy people and not a worthy nation or a wealthy region of poor people? she added.

2.3 African Minerals Development Centre (AMDC)

Mr. Mkhululi Ncube

This is what we at the African Minerals Development Centre (AMDC) expect from this forum. We hope to engage with everyone on matters that have to do with the community of practice that exists in managing natural resources and inequalities. That community of practice surely does not exist and that dearth of knowledge is what has pushed us to ensure that we come through.

In as much as we focus on mining and solid minerals development, the contended issue of inequalities cuts across the extractives: mining, oil, gas, and any other natural resources that require to be developed for the benefit of everyone. Therefore, the dearth in a community of practice ensures that we come through starting with West Africa and then link up with the other regional blocks under the African Union Commission, in looking at the issues related to managing natural resources and addressing inequalities.

By the end of the conference, we hope to engage with all the major stakeholders here. The AMDC will host a webinar by the end of the year on these same issues but from the mining perspective. We would therefore want to have the papers presented at this conference added to the papers that are being developed by the social research arm of the University of Montreal (UoM). UoM has asked us to give our comments on their papers which are not necessarily broadly connected to natural resources, but particularly focused on mining and the nexus between mining and health.

Covid 19 was an unfortunate great equalizer that made us realize that no matter how rich we are, we are all the same when it comes to certain issues like health. Based on this, we need to ensure that mining feeds into a universal healthcare system that does not discriminate and ensures that everyone receives healthcare regardless of what they are worth. Mostly those who are not wealthier are the ones who suffered the most when it came to covid 19, but this also showed us that even if you are wealthy, you need to be concerned when it comes to issues of health care for all.

It is that angle that we come from when we talk about issues of managing resources and addressing inequalities. We hope that that community of practice will be growing and that depth of information and knowledge will be unpacked.

2.4 Publish What You Pay (PWYP)

Mr. James Koruo

Greetings from the Global Council, the International Secretariat in Africa Steering Committee of Publish What You Pay. PWYP is honoured and delighted to be part of this high-level conference as it relates to natural resources and their management in our region.

Liberia is my Country, and it is said that they have resources in abundance, yet the country is poor on the continent and in the world due to the poor management of resources. These resources include diamonds, gold, iron ore, timber, and oil; yet a common Liberian lives on less than a dollar a day.

This is a problem that exists not only in Liberia but in the whole of Africa. It is imperative at this time that our countries in the region gather as we have done today, to brainstorm and identify current challenges and see how our policies on development can be aligned to revenue generated from our resources to benefit everyone.

Thank you and PWYP is much more delighted to be a part of this meeting. As we gather here for the next two and a half days, we must consider every discussion. It is also important we discuss how documents developed from this meeting can feedback into our different countries' resources advocacy work with institutions that work in different sectors. Civil society can be more robust in terms of advocating for the responsive management of our national resources for the common good of Africa. Thank you.

2.5 Statement By Director General, National Development Planning Commission, Ghana

Dr. Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa

Natural resources on planet Earth have been an asset to many nations. Growing up, I spent most of my formative years in mining communities starting from Awaso where Bauxite is mined, and later to Dunkwa On-Offin and finally to Tarkwa where gold is extracted before leaving for the University. So, I have an intrinsic link to natural resource extraction development and utilization. I also come from an area where a lot of people are engaged in mining activities as a way of livelihood. But the question we keep asking ourselves is, "What have we as a people gained from all these natural resources which belong to all of us to improve the condition and the welfare of our people and for generations yet

unborn”? Traditionally, the chief held these resources in trust for the people and ensured that every member of the community gets to benefit from them; but the situation changed when formal and very complex contracts were introduced. The communities to which these natural resources belong normally do not have a part to play in these agreements and so they are denied access and benefits to the resources.

What has been the contribution of natural resources to the development of our countries? Very often we express that in figures and percentages and then begin to fashion out the relationship between the owner, the user, and essentially the beneficiary. The case is not different from most of the West African countries where exports of these natural resources have been substantial. Gold for instance is the most exported product in Ghana accounting for over 5 billion US Dollars.

And so, at NDPC we will look at the whole natural resource management process from the perspective of policies, systems, structures, implementation, resource gain, and distribution. We also look at the marketing, institutions, capacity building on knowledge and skills development. These are the key things we need to consider and identify potential areas for review, especially in the area of policies in our discussions. The other side that also needs to be looked at, is the system and structures which keep widening instead of reducing. We need to find out the segment of people around which these systems and structures revolve. In our part of the world, enforcement of our great laws and regulations has always been a challenge.

To conclude, I have always asked myself: “How are we getting closer to attaining SDG 10”? The data from Ghana’s current census clearly shows that we are nowhere close to achieving SDG10 since inequality keeps widening. The gap between the rich and poor, the haves and have-nots continue to deepen especially in areas where natural resources are extracted. And so, we need to critically look at how we can bridge the gap. Again, the other thing crucial for us to look at is the future generation. What economy are we leaving for them? What environment, water, and farmlands are we bequeathing to them? We at the commission and as civil society need to be quite daring to change the situation, he added.

3.0 CONFERENCE PAPERS

3.1 PAPER 1: INEQUALITIES AND NATURAL RESOURCES GOVERNANCE: A BROAD WEST AFRICAN PICTURE

Mr. Charles Abugre – Development Economist, IDEAS

What is Inequality?

There is a big caveat with regards to inequalities and that is, when you want to start understanding the nature of inequalities, you frequently encounter data issues, yet inequalities are broad and have different dimensions. That part that is often spoken about is the distribution of income and the data that exist about the distribution of income is very spotted and not consistent across West Africa, but the bit that you aggregate, much of it is measured statistically as Gini coefficient.

Income distribution can be further grouped under:

- **Household:** The measured income is largely from Household surveys. This can be vertical. It is measured in terms of how far away a household, a group of households, or a country overall is from a perfect income distribution which is a zero inequality or perfect inequality.

- **Functional:** This is one of the dimensions of inequality that are far less looked at. An example is Income distribution functionally between wage earners and nonwage earners. Functional distribution of income is important but there is hardly any measurement for it.
- **Social Groups:** For Example, gender- men and women, ethnic groups, etc. Likewise, it is difficult to get data on income distribution on gender.
- **Spatial:** rural-urban; village -city; south-north; etc.

Wealth Inequalities:

Another form of inequality that is least measured is inequalities through wealth distribution. Wealth is the main asset from which you get your income. Thus, owning land, a tractor, a mine, investment instruments, etc. generates a flow of income. Wealth measurement is more important than income because wealth inequalities perpetuate themselves in generations. And hardly does any country measure wealth inequality. These inequalities can be measured at certain levels: national, household, social groups, etc.

Wealth has many forms but, financial assets are one form on which one has relative information (Bonds, stock, treasury bill) but information relating to nonfinancial wealth, including ownership of real estate, land, machinery, etc. is difficult to get yet inequalities are reflected in the disparities in the qualities of these assets. There is less data on this and even far less information on the gender distribution of wealth of these assets.

A Picture of Wealth Inequality - Continentally

According to the AfriAsia Bank (2018) Africa Wealth Report, about 2.3 trillion dollars of individual wealth is held on the continent of which US\$920 billion is held by High-Net-Worth Individuals (HNWIs) those who own one million dollars or more.

In 2017 148,000 HNWIs were living in Africa of which 7100 were multi-millionaires and 24 were billionaires. Nigeria, Ghana, and Ivory Coast contribute the bulk of West Africa's millionaires and billionaires.

The sub-region accounts for one-third of the estimated \$50bn of private wealth that leaves the African continent annually, free of tax, and observes that "*African countries are 20 years behind their European and North American peers in stemming tax abuse*".

In 2017, out of the top 10 countries in Africa, **Ghana, Côte D'Ivoire and Nigeria remain the wealthiest in West Africa**. Also, Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire are the two West African countries in which wealth was projected to have grown rapidly by 39% and 43% respectively.

Where Does the Wealthy Keep Their Wealth:

According to AfriAsia, most millionaires hold their wealth in cash, fixed deposits and residential real estate while 50% of assets are held offshore. For multi-millionaires, three-quarters of wealth is held off-shore and the remaining in equities and commodities. In addition to off-shore holding, billionaires hold their wealth in the form of business interest, private equity, and collectibles such as high-value paintings. It is estimated that 30% of Africa's wealth is held off-shore.

Income Inequalities:

From 2007-2017 *Cape Verde, Nigeria, Benin and Guinea Bissau were the top 4 West African countries that had inequalities in relation to income*. For the growth of income inequalities, some countries that currently have high levels of inequalities are projected to be declining and those that are relatively low levels of inequalities are projected to be increasing, this includes Ghana.

If we compare West Africa to other African countries in terms of the degree of inequality, the ECOWAS region is supposed to be less unequal on average compared to the East African Community, and SADC.

However, if you look at individual countries, some countries compare themselves with Southern and East Africa.

Southern and East Africa have very unique cases; because there are colonial occupier settlements in them who appropriated the land and the land resources and that has created that momentum on inequalities. For West Africa we do not have that yet, the levels of inequalities are very high. When you take gender inequalities, West Africa is the highest close to North Africa in terms of gender issues.

The SDG Inequality Target

The SDGs want us to find out what is happening to the income share of the bottom 40%. The **Palma Ratio is a much better measure for these inequalities and not the statistical measure which uses Gini**. The Palma ratio is a slightly better measure in terms of the disparities. It is the measure of the index bottom 40% of the population; this is to say, we have to decide what we are measuring for the sake of policies.

As said earlier, one of the targets of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) is that by 2030 each country must achieve and sustain income share growth for the bottom 40% of the population at a rate higher than that of the national average. **Burkina Faso is a good example of a country working towards achieving this target**. The income share of the bottom 40% rose by 42.55% and that of the top 10.0% fell by 25.06% between 1994 and 2014, giving a Palma ratio (income of the bottom 40% as a share of that of the top 10% of the population).

In the case of Senegal, IMF estimates that consumption of the poorest 10% relating to the richest 10% population did not change much between 1994 and 2011. In both periods the richest consumed more than 12-13 times that of the poorest.

Faults with progressive taxation and progressive expenditure

Data suggest that when you have progressive taxes and progressive expenditures, income inequalities come down and when that taxation is on wealth, wealth inequalities also come down.

When you measure health, education etc., there are different matrices to use. The useful measurement index to use is the **Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI)**. This puts together the gender index and the poverty calculation but also access to housing and energy consumption etc. This index also declined up to the mid 21st Century and started rising again.

Wage compression and Inequalities

Two things are happening to wages under functional income distribution:

1. **The gap between the highest paid and the lowest paid is high.** The worst are Ghana, Benin, and Togo. Concerning labour market participation by gender, fewer women participate in the labour market but there are more women than men who participate in the lower end of the labour market than men.
2. **There is a big gender wage gap between men and women.** There are rarely data on this.

For income taxes, the wage earners pay the highest tax but those who pay profit tax can underestimate profit and therefore pay less tax.

Natural Resource Intensity and Inequality

There is no certainty that a country is natural resources dependent. The highest percentage or a minimum percentage share of your GDP is based on natural resources, or a certain percentage share of your total export is based on natural resources. It depends on the particular resources. It seems that dependence on petroleum seems to engender a higher level of inequality. It also depends on how the revenues are spent. There is a lot of debate as to the impact of natural resources dependency on

extraction, on income distribution through what it does to the macroeconomy. Therefore, are you cursed or not when we have natural resources?

The literature of the paper suggests that in a certain type of political economy, some focus on progressive policies using natural resource revenues, maximizing the public share of natural resources and spending it properly in health, education and public sector roles contribute to reducing inequalities.

3.2 QUESTIONS AND CONTRIBUTIONS ON PAPER 1

1. **What are we doing to address the factors of inequalities regarding resource management because resources are finite and what can we do to that historical aspect to be able to track and trace? With Gender inequalities, it is the women who are at the lower bottom and the gap keeps widening up; what do we do to close inequality in the mining sector?**

Response:

The problem is not only about corruption, though. The purpose of our mobilisation and organisation is to alter the essence of the political settlement because the structure of the economy that was left for us, the nature of the policies we inherited, and the corruption issue are all a result of the political settlement we let to develop.

2. **According to an Oxfam paper in 2019 just 1% of the wealthiest West African individuals have more than the 99 persons combined in West Africa, what a great inequality!**

Response

Scandinavia is wealthy, yet inequality levels remain low because the country's initial policies promote actual wealth generation rather than rent-seeking. Many of our affluent individuals are not producing anything. Kenyans refer to them as "Tenderpreneurs." As a result, policies that promote real wealth creation and discourage rent-seeking have a significant impact on how we handle public policy.

The second is that since we all agree that a high salary is desirable for everyone, businesses and the government should pay their employees fairly. This increases distribution while decreasing profit taking, and as the economy expands due to widespread investment and consumption, inequality decreases.

The third option is to tax wealth. Even the conservative government in Britain is considering taxing unforeseen profits, so it is possible to tax wealth, including idling assets and property taxes. We must continue to fight on many fronts because we understand how the wealthy maintain their wealth and have an idea of how to reduce wealth concentration and redistribute it through public service.

Additionally, we must address the corruption problem. This conference is an opportunity for us to discuss these issues. Transnational corporations avoiding their obligations; capacity concerns since we are talking about natural resources, and the political settlement issue once again make up the international system that supports global inequities.

The capacity issue is how to accurately assess revenue use, the ability to access mining and oil company revenues, the actual value of oil and minerals being covered and extracted, and to properly monitor that. Politicians will get rid of them, but it is up to us to stand up for the non-corrupted auditor.

3. **What triggers inequalities? We do believe that we do not have equal opportunities. The caliber of people expected to be here at this conference are not here. The message can be carried to them, but we can certainly help ourselves to sensitize ourselves with the area we think can be helpful.**

Inequalities and opportunities are there but unfortunately, there are also unequal responses and ineffective responses to these opportunities. In managing our resources, first of all, we have to accept that it's a problem that needs to be solved; know the facts accurately and accept our readiness and the willingness on the part of authorities to ensure that this is done. We must be mindful of the consequences of our actions.

Response:

The question of opportunities can be addressed partly through fiscal policies of say: expenditure, taxes, labour market, etc. There are also several papers that try to address it in terms of how you use local content and the contribution to community development of any extractive firm; whether it is a forestry company, a mining company, or an oil company to contribute to community development; the structures that you need to put in there, is another way of expanding these opportunities.

4. **From the presentation it is said that there is a gender gap in terms of resources handled by women than men, are there reasons for that? Because in Africa we are patriarchal. What is our government doing? Because in terms of the laws that are laid down in terms of mining and managing natural resources. These are not working but rather discriminating against our communities. We need deliberate action from our government, and authorities and the need for them to interact with the community members.**

Response:

The issue of gender and women's rights is true. There is a lot we all must think about and that gender inequality in mining operations and its impact on national or community. The similarities are across all our countries and there are variations across all our countries; there is also the point of it which is that it is also about land.

There is a livelihood substitution for extraction and the land distribution question by gender is accentuated. Once it is noted that there is gold or another mineral in the land, the stakes are high, and the women are left out. The land question is about who owns it, once a certain wealth is declared? When it becomes forestry, and you were planning to farm it, forest protection, you do not have it. If there are gold or other minerals in it, the State takes responsibility of it and takes it through all sort of concessions and may not even inform you and so the land ownership dynamics changes everything completely.

5. **Who are we failing? Are we failing the country or the citizens? Where should our intervention focus on to reduce inequalities?**

Response:

We are failing both. Inequalities leave a lot of people behind in terms of their basic quality of life, etc., which is why inequalities are important. When inequality rises, it even affects the ability of economic development to be sustained and for it to contribute to reducing poverty; so, it leaves a lot of individuals behind, and it can create a lot of tensions at the community level and at multiple levels.

We are failing the citizens and the people but we are also failing the country because when it gets to a certain level and it contributes to violence, the State disintegrates and is even unable to perform its

basic function of keeping peace and security partly because, the resources are so misused. At this point, the people don't trust the State and there is too much contrast between the wealthy and the very poor. People will therefore take matters into their own hands. If that is the case, then we are failing our State.

If you believe that a stable State or a functioning State is important for promoting development and improving the quality of life for all of us, then you do not want your State to disintegrate and fracture.

3.2.1 CONTRIBUTIONS ON PAPER 1:

The following are contributions garnered during the plenary:

- Thank you very much. I appreciate the work that has been put into the presentation. The level of input that is required to come up with most of these inequality indices for a discussion of a public nature and the amount of work required is a lot, I applaud you and your team for this detailed economic analysis and unpacking the issues for debate.
- I encourage you to have that same team as a conglomerate for us to work with going further because, on issues relating to inequalities in mining, it is always a challenge to come up with the same level of indices, especially within small-scale mining and artisanal communities.
- I have worked extensively on artisanal and small-scale mining issues and currently, that is the biggest challenge we have when it comes to drafting policies in this area. The drivers of inequalities and the actual players on the ground: the sponsors specially create wealth inequalities even between gallamsay and their sponsors. These inequalities were never measured and hence no one ever understands how to deal with making sure the gallamsay stops and listens to policy suggestions. Because to them, if you are not giving them something to put on the table in a manner that they understand, they will not stop.
- So far, the discussion that has been made here is centered on mining! We need to include forestry and land acquisition which are also important under natural resource management. We have problems of inequalities under land acquisition as well as forestation and deforestation across the sub-region.

3.3 PAPER 2: POLITICAL ECONOMY OF EXTRACTIVISM:

3.3.1 The Political Economy of Natural Resource Governance and Inequalities in West Africa by Prof. Abdul-Gafaru Abdulai – University of Ghana Business School

Introduction:

Question for reflection: why do some countries in West Africa succeed in utilizing natural resource wealth for the reduction of inequalities while others do not?

To properly address this question, one must first find out which countries have succeeded and which have failed. Within the sub-region, *it has been a struggle to identify a country that has been able to manage its natural resources in a way that has contributed to inclusive and equitable development.* There are "no clear success stories" in Africa as a whole, with the exception of Botswana, which scholars and policymakers frequently cite as having avoided the "natural resource curse". However, one cannot confidently claim that Botswana has used its natural resources in a way that has reduced inequalities since stimulating growth and reducing poverty with natural resource wealth is not the same as reducing inequalities.

In the context of the struggle to find out the success stories of which country has been able to use its natural resources in addressing inequalities, there is the need to focus on three broad questions:

- Theoretically, what political economy dynamics are likely to facilitate governments' ability in utilizing natural resource wealth for reducing inequality?
- How have some countries across the globe managed their natural resource revenues in ways that facilitated the reduction of inequalities, and what political economy factors made the adoption and implementation of such policies both desirable and feasible?
- What lessons can West Africa's natural resource-dependent countries learn, and what are the most promising avenues for translating mineral rents into equitable development outcomes in the sub-region?



Prof Gafaru Abdulai

The Political Economy of Natural 'Resource Curse' Thesis

- **The natural resource curse phenomenon:** National resources generate astronomical rents for political elites and companies, yet employ few of the masses and the rents are hardly used for the pursuit of broad-based development.

- **Institutionalist theories** suggest that there is nothing inherent in natural resources that make them a curse. The quality of political institutions and the presence of accountability mechanisms for State leadership can neutralize the perverse incentives that resource rents create for patronage spending. Natural resources can lower inequality if the level of democracy in a country is high. Empirically, there is no clear relationship between regime types and the performance of natural resource-rich countries in terms of development. As a matter of fact, some non-democratic countries perform much better in managing natural resources than so-called democracies.

A DFID paper presented in 2010, states that 'the historically specific dynamics of political

settlements explain the difference in performance between countries with apparently similar endowments or disadvantages.'

Political Settlement Types and their Implications

There is a need to pay attention to how power is organized in society. Distribution of power is normally grouped into two: one single dominant party/leader or competitive clientelism. Depending on how power is organized, it has implications. The argument is that, if power is **concentrated within the hands of a dominant party or leader, there is relatively little chance of losing power to oppositional forces and so they can make long-term policy choices. On the other hand, if power is so dispersed and ruling political elites have a high possibility of losing the next election, they tend to focus on short-term, visible symbols of development largesse that enhance prospects of winning the next elections. Ghana as an illustrative case study.**

Ghana's political context: Competitive Clientelism

Ghana's political context has been Competitive Clientelism and the distribution of power in Ghana has largely been a contest between two dominant political parties, i.e., the New Patriotic Party (NPP) and the National Democratic Congress (NDC). No ruling party is 100% convinced that it will stay in power after the next election. Election data shows that, in 1992, the percentage of the vote that separated the two parties was 28% and in 2008, the margin of votes that separated them was less than 0.5%. That of the recent elections held in 2020 was 3.93%. What this means essentially is that those in power are becoming more vulnerable which make them prioritize only visible form of short investments-termed political pay-offs.

Poverty and Inequality Trends

Even though poverty has been decreasing consistently since 1990, the Gini coefficient which measures the inequality among values of a frequency distribution, such as the levels of income has consistently been widening. **A more dramatic version of inequality is the 'North-South Income Divide' problem where the regions in the Northern part of the country have historically remained much poorer than those in the South since colonial times.**

Gold Mining

Ghana remains the first producer of gold in Sub-Sahara Africa and 10th in the world yet according to a World Bank report in 2003, it is "unclear what gold mining's true benefits are to Ghana. Rents are heavily centralized and put in consolidated funds and in most cases, misused. For chiefs, it is for the maintenance of stools, not necessarily for community development, leading to conflicts between communities on the one hand, and chiefs and companies on the other.

Pathways to Inclusion

Key question: How have natural/national resources around the globe succeeded in addressing the problem of inequality?

Four broad approaches were identified.

1. **Direct cash to all citizens.** A typical example is Alaska, the USA which has been practicing this since the 1980s.
2. **Invest the resources in high-yielding infrastructure** to spur growth.
3. **Disproportionate allocation of revenues to regions of extraction.**
4. **Progressive fiscal contracts.**

This paper advances the argument for the **'Progressive Fiscal Contracts'** approach for West Africa as a means of incentivizing the government to earmark a specific portion of national resource wealth for **investing in human capital development, universal social protection and education.** The impact of social spending and social protection on inequality is quite well-documented. Countries like Bolivia and Mongolia have success stories based on this approach.

Again, many governments are already implementing social grant systems, which could be linked to revenues from extractive industries.

3.3.1.1 REFLECTIONS BY DISCUSSANT

Prof. Raymond Atuguba, University of Ghana Law School

Point one: Africa inherited independence from a legacy of exploiting our natural resources. Exploitation, however, means exactly what it is—a horrible thing. No one wants to be exploited and yet Africa continues to give out their natural resources to be exploited. There is a need to have a rethinking on our policies on the exploitation of natural resources if we want to see growth and reduce inequality. We need to start **governing our resources** and determining proper rules for generating natural resources in a way that benefits the citizens equitably for all generations.

The second thing to consider is to effectively manage conflict arising from the generation and distribution of the resources. Unfortunately for Africa, we have reduced governance to mean having elections every four or five years and anti-corruption campaigns. Meanwhile, statistics indicate that corruption only accounts for 30% of the waste in Africa and 5% of the illicit financial flows. Non-State actors must be challenged to channel their energy and resources in ensuring that States do not lose money through tax evasion and other schemes (which account for 70% of the waste) perpetuated by foreign mining companies/private sector.

Point two: Civil societies have abandoned the arena of governing natural resources and toed the line of democratic consolidation- election monitoring, while they look on for the private sector to exploit our natural resources with their own certain draconian rules.

1st Rule: Africans formally own the natural resources, but real ownership lies with the private sectors.

2nd Rule: After disruption to the traditional way of life, environment, and sustainable mechanisms for resource extraction, the private sector will substitute exploitative, unsustainable and expensive systems to cure the ills.

3rd Rule: The cost of the clean-up would be passed on to Africans to pay. This leaves revenue that is accrued to the State at about 5 to 13%.

In most instances, the cost of curing the environmental mess and rehabilitating life surpasses the percentage African countries receive from natural resources and so earmarking a portion of the revenue for social protection and human capital development becomes a mirage.

Point 3: The problem of natural resource exploitation is heightened by certain caricature definitions of democracy in Africa, where **democracy has been reduced to monied electoral democracy - 'monocracy'**. In other words, the more money you have the higher your chances of winning an election. The outcome of this is that nationalism has dimmed progressively. Few 'investors' who sponsor these political activities now feed into this caricature, and by feeding and sustaining it, they control the resources of the State and use it to gain more power and influence to enrich themselves while the majority of the people languish in poverty.

3.3.1.2 Questions and Contributions

- I was involved in the compilation, creation, and review of policy documents and programmes when oil was first discovered in Ghana. One strong statement in almost every conversation at the time was, "We don't want to look like Nigeria". The question now is, what happens when Ghana is now caught up in the 'resource curse'?

- It is an undeniable fact that a *“lot of water has gone under the bridge”* and unless we start to take a drastic decision and rethink, we might not be able to save the situation and make the most of what we want from our natural resources. On the issue of the colonial legacy which has led to the kind of economic system we have now, it is observed that in most African States debt levels continue to rise. What then can we do as Africans when our natural resources which the State manages in trust for the people are extracted or mined by multinational corporations to whom we are indebted? How then do we use resource governance to tackle inequalities when we are in multiple ways not owning anything ourselves?
- The presentation delivered by Prof. Atuguba has agitated us to take immediate action, but I ask myself: with what voice and strength? This leads me to my next question which is, who goes to the negotiation table and how inclusive are we in these negotiations? Many a time you would see only the politicians on the negotiation table while the experts are sidelined.
- What lessons are we learning from the Francophone experience in reshaping political settlement?
- From the analysis, we are told that natural resources are not inherently linked to deepening inequality, but my question then is, what forms of inequalities are we looking at? income inequalities or other forms of inequalities?
- I think that the challenge we have in Africa is not necessarily about the type of political settlement structure but the quality of leadership because we have had some long-standing leaders in some African States. You can talk about Yoweri Museveni of Uganda and yet those countries are not doing better than countries where elections are held every 4 or 5 years. To me, the question is, how do we connect the dots and make sure we are not separating the question of leadership from the equation? If we are having elections, how then do we ensure that we are electing the right people into leadership? My next comment is on the waste that Prof. Atuguba talked about. And that is, civil society focuses on the 70% revenue waste through tax evasion and profit shifting, and not corruption. But I think what we have to recognize is that the waste comes from corruption through negotiations and power settlement.
- In all of these discussions, are we focusing on the right interventions and what we need to do as a country? I think as civil societies, we should **focus our interventions at the community level to understand and identify the real problems and to address them**. Because if a chief can collect money and give his people away, how do we make him understand the implications of what he is doing? Finally, if we are looking at using national resources to reduce inequality, then **we also need to look at the emotional connections that are attached to what we do to be able to repackage our stories to governments and people who can make a change**.
- Prof. Atuguba talked about Natural Resource Governance as opposed to Exploitation. I think that it is possible to govern our natural resources to ensure that our communities benefit from them. I share testimony to this from my country: Sierra Leone, where our parliament recently passed three major laws that will bring a change in the management of our natural resources. **This is the first time perhaps in 150 years where a community will have prior consent before any mining activity is undertaken on their land**. The law also allows for decision-making not to be in the hands of the chiefs alone but the involvement of community committees as well. Similarly, the law also stipulates that 1% of the gross revenue output as against 0.01% in the previous agreements, should go to the community directly for development, thanks to the effort by civil societies.

- In the presentation made by Prof. Abdulai on ‘The Political Economy of Natural Resource Governance and Inequalities’, he proposed ‘**progressive fiscal contracts**’ as a pathway to inclusion in addressing inequalities. This is not a new concept and so my question is why are we as a country not able to fully implement such policies.
- I want to ask a question on pathways to inclusion. I am speaking based on the Niger Delta experience where there has been a different level of intervention to promote inclusion and even in the case of the 13% derivation. Community members feel excluded as they don’t know how much is given to the State and what those amounts of money are used for. There is the Niger Delta Commission that is expected to promote and ensure community development as well as other bodies like the Ministry of Niger Delta Affairs as well as community corporations at the community levels, yet there is a disconnect between the people and the agencies resulting from a lack of access and influence. There is also the issue of male dominance and the representation of disabled groups. So, the question now is what is the proper pathway to inclusion?

Responses from Discussions by Prof Atuguba:

- The questions on what we do next, who do we take to the negotiation table and the issue of leadership can be best answered in one short but true story. There was a president in Ghana, who before becoming president didn’t have money and so ran a very modest campaign. So, his capacity to depend on the briefcase-holding people was minimal. Once in power, he could stand to his principles and ensure that the country is not short-changed by these oil companies. He also instituted a committee to review mining agreements and clauses to increase Ghana’s share of mining revenues.
- With regards to the question of progressive fiscal contracts, I don’t think any African country has tried implementing this approach to the best of my knowledge. The literature normally points to four countries including Mongolia and Bolivia that have done that quite successfully from which Africa can learn. In the case of Bolivia, it resulted from the Gas War reaching its peak in 2003 and led to the resignation of the president and a national referendum on the exploitation of the country’s vast natural gas reserves.
- We also need to understand that this study talks about Political Economy which seeks to discuss what is the ideal situation. And so, we need to look at this from the perspective of history, politics, and party ideologies to realise the impact we are looking for.
- The question asked on inclusivity has a bearing on the point that Prof. Atuguba made about the fact that the percentage of revenue that should go to the State/Communities is always in the negative and that means that eventually there is nothing to earmark for social protection and community development. My point is that the States are not getting enough revenue from our natural resources. There is also the problem of elite political capture who are the main beneficiaries of the resources that are supposed to go to the disadvantaged people. **It is a fact in the case of Ghana, that the State has made over a billion dollars in the last decade since oil discovery in the country, but much hasn’t been done to address the problem of inequality.**

3.3.2 KEY TAKEAWAYS FROM DAY ONE:

The following are the key points emerging at the end of day one:

Mrs. Beauty Emefa Narteh – Executive Secretary - Ghana Anti-Corruption Coalition

What stood out for me is our appreciation and understanding of the word ‘Governance’ and how it relates to the extractive sector. It has been deepened and the fact that we need to ensure community

ownership and how they can actively participate in the governance of our natural resources is fundamental.

Another word that came up strongly for me is the **issue of corruption**. It is important that we broaden our scope of understanding of corruption in terms of natural resource governance and not limit it to perceived monetary or physical gains. There are issues of conflict of interest, and abuse of office which are pervasive when it comes to natural resource governance. **There is documented evidence, for example of scholarship schemes being awarded to the children of the managers of these natural resources instead of going directly to the children in the communities where these resources are extracted.**

Mr. George Owusu – Ghana’s Land Commission

We have established from this conference that inequalities arise from the exploitation of our natural resources and so there is a need to properly govern it to change the narrative. To me, one way to go is to see how we can support the communities to address land boundary issues and then effectively monitor the implementation of the various policies and ensure that institutions that are mandated to enforce compliance are doing their work.

Mr. Mkhululi Ncube – Program Officer - African Mineral Development Center (AMDC)

My closing comment for this session of the day would be to highlight a part of the AMV vision of the African Mineral Development Center which addresses almost half of the issues raised here. It states, **“a transparent, equitable and optimal exploitation of mineral resources to underpin broad-based sustainable growth and social economic development”**. To me, every discussion and question asked fits into this broad vision of the Center and fortunately, that is why the African Mining Vision exists. The AMDC is clothed with the function to ensure this vision of the social and economic transformation of Africa.

3.4 PAPER 3: ECONOMIC GOVERNANCE, NATURAL RESOURCES, AND INEQUALITIES

3.4.1 NATURAL RESOURCES AND INEQUALITY IN WEST AFRICA

Dr. Raymond Boadi Frempong – Chair of Development Economics, University of Bayreuth, Germany

Introduction

This presentation aligns and continues with the presentation delivered by Charles Abugre on inequality in West Africa and Africa.

The general issue is that the gap between the rich in the poor in terms of economic and social inequality continues to be widening. The situation **appears to be worse in West Africa where the wealthiest 1% own more than everyone else in the sub-region**. This contrast with the fact that a significant proportion of the sub-region’s wealth is natural resource-based. For example, 9% of the world's bauxite and 8% of gold deposits are found in West Africa. Nigeria is a significant producer of crude oil in the world.

It is against this background that this paper seeks to answer two main questions;

1. What is the relationship between natural resource dependence and inequality (wealth and social inequalities)?
2. What is the commitment of national and sub-regional governments to fighting inequalities?

What does the literature say?

There are two scenarios that the literature points to. The first is that natural resource dependence could potentially increase inequalities. The possible reasons are the fact that, the natural resource and extractive industry tend to be capital intensive with less forward and backward linkages. It is a niche industry with multinational dominance and little interaction with local industry. There is also the tendency of elite capture, lack of accountability and environmental pollution.

The other side of the argument is that, resource dependence in itself is not bad and may lead to reduced inequalities with proper institutional structures in place: accountability, government commitment and the right policy framework.

Data and Methods used to measure the levels of Inequality:

To determine the inequality levels in relation to resource dependence in West Africa, different sources of measurement were used. For inequality, the **Gini Coefficient** and the **Social Progress Index**, which provide data on the performance of the social and environmental needs of a country including education, gender parity, and maternal mortality, were used.

Two variables were used to determine natural resource dependence, expressed as a percentage of the total exports of the country. First is the **Mineral Resource Rents** - GDP share of the difference between the value of production for a stock of minerals at world prices and their total production costs. The second variable used is the **Natural Resource Rent** - GDP share of total natural resources rents (the sum of oil, natural gas, coal, mineral, and forest rents).

For institutional variables, the **Voice and Accountability Index**, which is the perceptions of the extent to which a country's citizens can participate in selecting their government, as well as freedom of expression, freedom of association, free media, and **Commitment to Reducing Inequality** which measures countries' performance on three indicators - social spending, progressive taxation, and labour rights were used.

Overview of Inequality in West Africa

The data for inequality levels in West Africa was compared to the average in Africa which is slightly above 40%. Generally, the data shows that West Africa's performance is slightly higher compared to Africa as a whole. Between 2009 to 2018, Cape Verde, Guinea-Bissau, Ghana, and Benin had a higher average of inequality compared to Africa's 41% with **Togo being the most unequal with an average Gini Coefficient of 43.83. Guinea tends to be better in West Africa with an average of 31.65%.**

Relationship Between Natural Resource Dependence and Inequalities

To compare West Africa to the rest of Africa, data were compared between the Natural Resource Rent expressed as a percentage of GDP and income inequality between 2009 – 2018. The statistics show that there is a slight relationship between income inequality as measured in the Gini coefficient and natural resource rent as a percentage of GDP. The data shows that, the impact in West Africa is lower compared to that of Africa.

The data trend is not much of a difference in the relationship between social progress versus natural resource rents. However, the interpretation of the data reveals a sharp contrast with the data on income inequality and natural resource rent which indicates that natural resource dependence tends to reduce inequality slightly in West Africa. However, on the other side, with higher natural rent, social progress tends to be small. This means that, as countries in the sub-region export more of their natural resources, issues of access to education, school enrolment, child labour, maternal mortality, and environmental degradation tend to be worsened. Comparing West Africa to that of Africa, one could say that, countries within the sub-region are not performing better than Africa.

Resource Dependence and Commitment to Reducing Inequality

The data collected shows that generally in Africa, countries whose natural resource exports account for more than 25% of the country's total exports are less committed to reducing inequality. Comparing Africa to that of West Africa, one can say resource dependent countries have a higher average in reducing inequality than non-resource dependent countries.

Summary of Results

Natural resources appear to be reducing income inequality in West Africa and Africa: there is some amount of trickle-down effect whereas social inequalities tend to worsen with higher resource dependence. **The point is that the more a country is natural resource dependent, the less committed a government is to addressing inequalities broadly in society.**

Gender parity is high as well as issues with access to quality water and food security due to environmental pollution. There are clear examples of the social decline because of natural resource dependence. Commitment to school infrastructure, enrollment, and completion has also become a concern.

Finally, policy and institutions may matter in addressing these inequalities issues. **National governments should be committed to reducing inequality and making sure the average citizen benefits from the income from natural resources. ECOWAS also has a duty to ensure that the directive principles for the extractive industries that look inward for human resources and local content laws are adhered to.**

3.4.1.1 DISCUSSANTS ON PRESENTATION II

3.4.1.2 1ST DISCUSSANT: MR. EMMANUEL KUYOLE – PROGRAM OFFICER, FORD FOUNDATION

From yesterday and today's presentations, there have been quite some interesting issues that have been raised. I want to begin by asking a basic question. Why do we extract natural resources? To find the answer to this question, one would assume that this is a question that has been adequately answered or that the answer should either be in a national development strategy document or a specific natural resource sector policy document.

Surprisingly, for a very long time, most countries in the sub-region either haven't answered this question adequately or have not answered it at all. And so, the ultimate aim of natural resource extraction which is to generate benefits for the people is not actually addressed at that level. The point is that there are a lot of countries that have been extracting for a very long time but without specific sector policies. In most cases, the policies came in later after the extraction started many years later including putting in place key institutions that have the responsibility of addressing these inequalities. Till now some of these institutions are still grappling with the sector and are unable to offer solutions to some of the questions we are asking.

To address these inequality issues and many other challenges that we face in Africa, it needs to be integrated into the national development framework and the conversation about natural resources should be at the centre of the poverty reduction and inclusion discourse and not be run parallel. There should be a cost-benefit analysis on the decisions informing the extraction of natural resources on the lands that serve as a source of livelihood for communities.

This leads me to my next question: is it possible to talk about natural resource governance without looking at the broader context of governance of our national economies? The situation we find ourselves in the sub-region suggests that it seems we have mismanaged everything else and yet we

think that we can achieve good governance with our natural resources. **There are issues of lack of accountability of public financial management and corruption from the national through to local government level.** And so, **the conversation about managing natural resources effectively cannot be realized unless it is linked to the broader efforts of good governance in society.**

The other thing we must look at in addressing the problem of inequality, poverty, and exclusion, is that **governments' revenue mobilization through taxation should be invested efficiently and equitably.** But then, we need to have a critical look at how we can efficiently collect rents from the natural resource sector. In Africa, a lot of money is being lost through tax evasion and profit shifting. According to a 2021 IMF data, tax-based erosion and profit shifting from sub-Saharan Africa, between 470 million dollars and 700 million dollars are lost annually mainly from the natural resource sector. And so, we need to find a way to pluck the loopholes. In recent times, there have been lots of talk about the green economy and according to research, the world would need to increase cobalt and lithium production (which are very abundant in the sub-region) to about 500% in twenty to thirty years to achieve net-zero. What this means is that **there is going to be an intensification of mineral extraction in our region and so if nothing is done about this kind of tax evasion, then West African problems will continue for a long time.**

The next thing I want to talk about is **local content** which we need to place much emphasis on to address some of the social challenges in our countries. The challenge for our region is that for most of our economies, the issue of local content came up after we had extracted our natural resources for many years and even after we embraced it, we have often reduced local content to mean, how many people have gained employment by the companies extracting the resources. **Local content means more than that, it is about maximizing value addition to the economy for undertaking extractive activities.** In countries like Norway, a company is not expected to go into production without first submitting a local content plan approved by the sector Minister. In the case of Africa, it is the reverse: exploration is done and then production begins before we begin to talk about local content. If we look at the data, companies make a tax payment of about 50 million dollars and then spent close to about 150 million to 300 million dollars on particular procurement activity. While the government is focused on the 50-million-dollar tax, the question we need to be asking ourselves is, **what measures are in place to ensure that the 150 million dollars spent on services and procurement activities remain in the country?** The challenge is that we don't have local enterprises with the capacity to absorb this money and so it leaves the country most of the time. The other issue is that local content efforts are not being linked to the local trade and investment policies in the country.

3.4.1.3 2ND DISCUSSANT: MR. BISHOP AKOLGO – FORMER EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, ISODEC

Going back to the basics, there is the need to upset the current political settlements where there are few political elites who capture benefits from the rent of our natural resources. The current political settlement around natural resources is that the central government takes its share of the rent, and gives some to the chiefs and the district assemblies while the local people are left out of the equation. This arrangement is not different from what seems to be the case in the 1700s when ownership and extraction of natural resources were between the village chiefs and those involved in the extraction of the natural resources.

When the white man came to Africa, complaints were made against the chiefs that the people were not benefiting from resources. The white man then through indirect rule agreed on a settlement of a sharing ratio between the Chiefs and those involved in the extraction. They later leveraged this by identifying and training a few particular groups of people against others to institute an indirect rule in exploiting our mineral resources, before the State came in to take over the responsibility of managing our resources. And so, **if we want to reduce inequality and bring social development, we need to**

upset the current political settlement where only a few political elites are harvesting from the benefit of our natural resources. The issue of cronyism, nepotism, and corruption must also be addressed so as not to distort our markets and widen the inequality gap.

Again, we should also be looking at ways of building an alternate economy by investing in the local economic development through education, and skills acquisition. Effective local content will ensure that Africans can build their economies away from natural resource dependence having in mind that these resources are exhaustible.

3.4.1.4 QUESTIONS AND CONTRIBUTIONS

Question

- It is important that Dr. Frimpong related the extractives to progressive taxation and how that could bridge the gap of inequality in West Africa. One element I see in this is the high level of indebtedness within the countries of the sub-region. For example, Sierre Leone's debt to the IMF is about 3 billion, which is 43% of its GDP and that of Ghana is about 54 billion dollars, which is 78% of its GDP per annum. How then do we ensure progressive taxation when we are highly indebted? Can we depend on progressive taxation to plough back in addressing the inequality gaps when we have these commitments to make to the IMF and other international bodies?

Response:

- *It is important for us to first find out how those debts were accumulated and link them to natural resources. It would interest you to know that most of those debts started with the discoveries of natural resources. Once a natural resource is discovered, there is the appetite for governments to borrow more with the hope that they can use rent and taxation from the resource to pay it back. Meanwhile, the rents from natural resources are volatile due to price instability in the market. And so even though most countries have what we call revenue management arrangements which stipulate the priority areas and how much to spend, how much to save and how much to redistribute to affected communities, a lot of the money that needs to be invested in meeting the social needs of the communities are used to service debts. In short, despite these revenue management frameworks, the problem is that the money earmarked for development doesn't go there and the little that passes through the pipe is leaked and eventually what gets to the communities for development is inefficiently managed and misappropriated.*

Question

- How can Africa equally participate in the profits of the extractive value chain when we are only participating in the production and being consumers of finished products? Where are we in the profit line of distribution, marketing, and manufacturing?
- I want to add my voice to the issue of local content. My name is Georgette Barnes and I run a mine support service company. When we speak about local content, we speak about people and products. Ghana seems to be doing quite well in terms of jobs, and even exports some of the expertise to other West African countries and beyond. But we need to do more work in terms of the supplies and value addition. There are skills and technology problems and issues with capacity, quality and standardization. Access to financing and the high interest rate are also a challenge to local manufacturing. And so, there is a lot of work we must do in unpacking the issues of production through to manufacturing and addressing them for local entities to take full advantage of local content.

Response:

- *I agree with the points and concerns raised except to say that, to make local content work effectively, it is important to ensure that there is clarity on exactly what the companies involved in the extractions have to do. The agencies responsible for ensuring compliance must also step-up their game on enforcement and not only be interested in generating internal funds arising out of non-compliance from the industries.*

Contributions:

- Looking at the indicators which Dr. Frimpong explained in his presentation and because of climate change, I want to ask a question on whether water is a natural resource. Most areas are fast drying up and the earlier we factor that into our conversation the better. We need to look at the cost of treatment of water arising out of pollution and contamination.
- On progressive taxation and debt management in most cases, the people managing the sector at the forefront are completely novices who know nothing about the sector that is highly technical. And so, one key thing that should come out of this meeting is for us to **push for experience and professionalism to invoke accountability and transparency.**



A participant making contribution to the discussions

3.5 PAPER 4: FEMINIST PERSPECTIVE ON EXTRACTIVISM IN WEST AFRICA

3.5.1 GENDER JUSTICE & EXTRACTIVISM IN WEST AFRICA: WHAT ARE FEMINIST GROUPS SAYING & DOING ABOUT IT?

Dr. Iheoma Obibi – African Feminist and Human Rights Activist

Reinventing the Wheel – The Problems

The discussion around natural resource extractivism, gender and feminism in West Africa is critical. Natural resource extraction is largely a male-driven exercise as well as having the privilege of whiteness, class, education, colonial history, etc. Evidence demonstrates that its leadership configuration is exclusionary, access to power, language and infrastructure as well as lacking transparency in the awarding of contracts, and deliberate community isolation (especially women, girls and the disabled).

Women bear a disproportionate share of social, economic and environmental risks. Not forgetting population displacements and accelerated levels of inequality and economic exclusion. Examples abound in Somkhele and Fuleni communities in KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa, where women took matters into their own hands when their water table got disrupted.

Extractivism is Unequal, It's Unjust, It's Gendered

We need to recognize the links between mining, extractivism and violence against women (VAW). Extractivism's impacts on women's bodies, sexuality and autonomy cannot be underestimated. Extractive industries have a huge impact on land and water which are essential communal resources women use to sustain the livelihoods of their families and communities.

Again, as a result of inequality and gendered divisions of labour, women take on a social reproduction role (unpaid labour) within the African working-class communities. As such, they are heavily affected by the extractive industries. It is also important for us to understand that, throughout the chain of exploration, contracting and licensing, operations and extraction, VAT and royalty collection, and revenue distribution and management, women and men face different needs and opportunities.

Covid19 global pandemic exacerbated the impact on women and communities with few governments (for example, the ReconAfrica Oil & Gas exploration in the Kavango region of Namibia as a case study) categorizing mining as an essential service and contributing to economic recovery and thus enabling mining operations to continue despite the substantial risk.

In view of these challenges, **efforts must be made to capture women's concerns in the initial stages of impact assessment and consultation during exploration and include them when disseminating the findings.**

The Gendered Impact and the Linkages:

The violence manifests itself in different ways. For example, through conflict, **corporations and States employ 'divide and rule' tactics** to force community decisions in favour of extraction. Land dispossession forces communities off their lands to make way for extractive interests and then left with scarce resources to support their lives and livelihoods.

Criminalisation, sexual violence and intimidation of women human rights defenders are usually the ones that begin the campaign and activism. There are high levels of interpersonal violence against women in families, and communities that have links to State and corporate-sponsored violence that take place in areas where extractive industries exist.

Climate change causes drought and water scarcity, which also negatively impacts agricultural production. And because of the gendered divisions of labour and women's reproductive role, they experience disproportionately negative impacts. For example, the oil spill in the Goi, K-Dere and Bodo communities (in the Gokana LGA of Rivers State, Nigeria), has contaminated the rivers and destroyed the flora and fauna that helped to sustain healthy livelihoods.

What Can Women Do Effectively?

To develop resilience and effective local organizing, **women must lead and define the change and alternatives.** There is a need for grassroots movement building involving women and their communities as seen in Uganda, DRC and Niger Delta. Working towards crafting a strategic "here and now" campaign whilst strengthening analysis on the realities of a post-extractivist transformation.

A new development agenda with alternative frameworks must be considered and the intensification of advocacy and campaigns around gender-responsive due diligence addressing community relations, land acquisition and resettlement, security, local content, grievance resolution, and strategic social investment are key.

*3.5.1.1 DISCUSSANT I: - Senior Regional Coordinator for Francophone West Africa – PWYP
Mr. Demba Seyouyi*

For the past couple of years, I have had a strong commitment and engagement in gender issues. And this is because I am one of the very few men who speak on gender issues. What we normally see is that most of the time it is women who are advocates of gender issues and gender justice and so this makes me think that if there is any shift we must make, it is to **give the floor to more men to advocate**

for women's rights and gender Justice. There is a certain belief that when women advocate for their rights, it is a kind of using or asking for more power for themselves and it comes as a threat to most men. So that's why I think we should give the floor to men to speak more on gender issues.

I believe all of us gathered here believe that women's rights and gender justice matter just as contract transparency, revenue distribution and environment and social impact matter. It is not an exaggeration to say that it is women's survival that matters in the extractive sector because beyond the economic inequalities, what women are facing in terms of revenue distribution, local content, etc..., **is their livelihood that is at threat and so all that women are seeking is the right to a decent livelihood, the right to survive, the right to get positive impacts from the extractives.**

I must also say that we have seen some efforts during the last couple of years in terms of policies and laws at national and regional levels aimed at addressing gender-based issues. ECOWAS has recently developed a model Act in the extractive sector and that includes a provision on human rights and gender issues. Again, together with civil society like Women in Mining, Ford Foundation, and PWYP, efforts are being made in developing a charter in gender mainstreaming of the geo-extractive sector. The challenge is **that despite all these efforts, we have not yet developed a concrete operational action plan on how we want to implement those provisions.**

The second thing I want to add is that **we do not also have more concrete data on how women are impacted disproportionately by the extractive sector** that will help us gather more evidence on why we need to ask for more from the industry players. This data will also help us to identify how and at which level the exclusion of women in all the value chain is increasing inequality and disharmony in the extractive sector.

I will want to conclude with this story: *"A teacher once gave an assignment to his students to find out who a leader is in their family context. A boy went back home and asked his father and the father told him that the leader in the family is someone who wakes up earlier to make sure everything is ok for the kids to go to school and ensures that everyone gets breakfast in the morning and the leader is someone who makes sure that you can have food to eat when you get back home from school. He is someone who makes sure the house is clean and ensures that the doors are closed when you sleep. The boy, then said to the father, "when I grow up, I want to be a leader like my mum because I see her do these things all the time".*

3.5.1.2 *2nd DISCUSSANT - Regional Director, Ford Foundation, West Africa*
Dr. ChiChi Aniagolu-Okoye

I want to begin by thanking the presenters for their thought-provoking papers. They have helped us to appreciate what it means for women in the extractive sector. I was able to identify about five issues that came up in terms of the relationship between women and the extractives which I want to reiterate.

The first thing I want to talk about is **the nature and history of extractives and the fact that the sector is very masculine.** In the old days, women were probably excluded from work because work was regarded as hard labour and so it was hard to see women go into the mines. That construction is what has gone into the way of how we address mining and extractives in general. There is also **the history of whiteness, racism, and unfairness** that came with the exploitation of our natural resources which have had a major negative impact on women. There is the impact on women's income, the impact of women's way of life and so **once a community is disrupted by mining, women automatically become the losers.** But then, it is important to recognise that when we think about gender, it is not just about

women! It is **the relationship between women and men**, and we need to interrogate how we make gender more relevant to women in the extractive sector.

The presenters also talked about violence against women which is associated with the extractives. As natural resources become scarcer, the fight for them becomes intense and violent. For instance, a lot of the herder-farmer clashes that we experience in Nigeria is as a result of scarce natural resources even though there might be other dimensions to it like religious issues and climate change. The consequence of this violence is that it leads to more violence against women's bodies: more rape and other forms of violence.

I also see another **issue around policies and power imbalances**. And just as has been said earlier, we need to have a look at how the policies are implemented and how we can interpret them into actionable plans so they actually become active documents and not just sitting on shelves. **Again, we must look at the practice of extractivism. How is extraction done in a way that disenfranchises women?** The fact is that extractivism takes away farmlands, and water, and displaces communities and because women are the custodians of the home, they are greatly impacted. The engagement with the private sector and with the government also seems to disadvantage women. Not until now, women's voices have been missing for a long time. And the fact is that most women (including women groups) do not understand the extractives sector. It is also made worse by the fact that the issues do not affect all women except those in affected communities. And so, even in women's movement groups, the issue of extractivism does not become a topical issue. What then needs to be done, which one of the papers highlighted, is that **there should be a connection among the women's movement groups from the local to national level so that the issues women face become an issue for women's movements everywhere**.

I also believe that we need to **move from resistance to resilience**. What we need to understand is that the extractives are here to stay, as far as there is demand there will always be supply. As civil society, our natural inclination is to look at what is wrong and to agitate to make things better; but we also must **begin to look at a win-win situation**. The fact is that the private sector and governments need the revenues and they may not understand that they need to do it in a much better way. And so, as we look at why the government and the private sector behave the way they do, how can we make them behave better? We need to have a win-win mindset. As we keep demanding our rights, we have to do it in a way that ensures that nobody feels that they are a loser. The reality is that despite the challenges of extractivism, communities in the extractives in one way or the other, have also become dependent on the extraction and so disruption to the extraction activities could be further disruption to their livelihood.

Finally, we also need to **ensure that we carry men along in all these matters**. Yes, we know it is a power relation and unequal relationship in which men have power and the advantage; but the reality is that some men are also victims of patriarchy and suffer from unequal relations. And so, once we break it down to gender and not women, I think we can create a space to get everybody to sit at the same table to discuss how we can make the extractives benefit everyone.

3.5.1.3 CONTRIBUTIONS

- *I thank the presenter and all the people that have spoken especially on issues of gender. Most of the time we have reduced gender to mean women issues, but we need to understand that there are places and situations where women have a comparative advantage over men and vice versa. To add my voice to what Dr. Chichi said, we need to have a win-win situation to be able to make the necessary influence.*

- To address general inequality in resource extraction we need to go one step below to the point where the whole problem of inequality starts, which is at the very fabric of society. That is the rural communities known to be very patriarchal. The steps we have taken in Sierra Leone are going in that direction. For instance, the law that was passed last week makes provision, first to eliminate discrimination against women across all customary rules.



A participant making contribution to the discussions

- So now **women can own, use, inherit and transfer land, and participate in decision-making which is not the case under most customary laws.** The law provides for women to act as heads and represent their families which are not common in many parts of the country. There is also a provision that allows for at least 30% of women's participation in land administration institutions at all levels.
- What I want to say is that in Nigeria, the paradigm that exists within the natural resource sector tends to favour the powerful which has been the case since colonial times. The other aspect of the conversation that I want to bring to the fore is how benefits from the extractives are shared. Again, Nigeria in attempting to address inequality by creating schemes like the **Niger Delta Development Commission**, the **Ministry of Niger Delta Affairs**, and recently the **Presidential Amnesty Programme** were instituted but the paradigm of inequality persists. When the amnesty programme for instance was established to investigate a settlement for militant groups which included women, only 0.1% of the beneficiaries were women.



A participant sharing an experience

- *Having worked in the forest areas in the Eastern part of the Niger Delta, the attempt by the UN-REDD Programme to have conversations with people has focused essentially on meetings with men. So even in the extraction of timber and conservation of the forest, women are still excluded. I think to respond to this kind of gender-based inequality there is a need for women to put women's issues on the agenda and insist that government policies take into consideration women's issues.*
- *My name is Chris and I work for the Nigeria Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (NEITI), and I want to contribute to what we in NEITI are doing. The NEITI in its wisdom in 2018 demanded that **Nigeria goes into gender and environmental reporting** and since then we have been reporting on gender and the environment. Recently on the 24th and 25th of May 2022, we held a stakeholder engagement sponsored by Ford Foundation, and what we looked at was increasing the advocacy towards the inclusion of gender and environmental reporting. The meeting also agreed that, for us to go forward, our advocacy should target increasing and including women in decision-making, increasing employment, ownership and benefits of extractive assets and active participation. There is a need for a paradigm shift and to start looking at what women can do in that sector to be able to address and reduce inequality.*
- *My contribution is to environmental assessment. The problem we have as a people is that **in most cases, the assessment is not done by the government but by the mining companies themselves and if that happens, how sincere would those assessments be** in looking at the socio-economic needs of the people and the environment? The other thing I want to discuss is on the call to carry the men along in discussing issues of gender which to some extent I believe. The challenge is that some of the men that are to be at the forefront in these issues of the extractives and gender matters are not abreast with issues of the extractives. I am saying this because a few weeks back I was in one of the mining communities in Sierra Leone to conduct some interviews and to my surprise, most of the chiefs do not know anything about the mining agreements and the operations of the mining companies in their communities. With regards to gender-based violence that happens in the communities, they are not handled with seriousness by the institutions that are clothed with the powers to handle such matters. For example, rape cases that are reported to the local police are mostly not dealt with to their logical conclusions.*
- *My take is on how the role of society has traditionally contributed to the kind of mindset we have in Africa and until we deconstruct our mindset traditionally and culturally, it will be very difficult to bridge the gender gap. There was research conducted in Sierra Leone in 2018 which indicated that while women worked for longer hours than men in unpaid domestic and care work, men received higher income than women. The reason is that women are engaged more in unpaid care work than men.*
- *I want to reiterate the point that, issues affecting girls and women should not be lost when we are discussing gender. It is very important that women's issues are addressed directly. Women should be consulted, and their input taken seriously in drawing local content plans before being submitted to the national government for approval if we want to end the many years of marginalization of women. Currently what pertains is that the community members do not have access to the document, not to even talk about women. There is the need to create the needed spaces for only women to meet where they can feel empowered to open and talk about their issues dispassionately.*
- *I want to suggest that as this meeting is supposed to be a West African conference within the sub-region, it will be imperative to have ECOWAS represented. And so next time when such conferences are organized, ECOWAS should be adequately represented. Their presence is very*

important to facilitate the amendment of their protocols of the recommendations that would be made during the conference.

- *I like the analysis that was brought up in this set of presentations. Previous presentations have focused more on income inequality and I feel like we are missing out on some of the big questions about women's voices and other minority groups that fit in this category. So, in some sense, I would think that the intersectional conversation should not be standalone. It should be included in statistical measurements and analysis. One that captures indicators of women's issues and other marginal groups and looks at a model that addresses gender issues.*

3.6 ENVIRONMENT, ENERGY AND RESOURCE GOVERNANCE

3.6.1 PAPER 1: LINKAGES BETWEEN EXTRACTIVES, ENVIRONMENTAL DAMAGE, & INEQUALITIES IN THE ECOWAS REGION

Lumun Amanda Feese and Dr. Chilenye Nwapi

Does environmental damage cause inequality?

In answering this question, two types of extractive industry: large-scale industrial mining and oil and gas production on one side versus artisanal and small-scale mining (ASM) were examined.

The literature revealed the power imbalances of inequality in society and determined that **the winners are the large** companies because of the access they have to the resources and **the losers are the communities because they occupy the lower end of the spectrum, and they depend on** the environment for their livelihood. Within this power imbalance, different groups are impacted differently. Rural communities suffer more than urban communities. In terms of environmental degradation, women are disadvantaged even within their communities. Small-scale mining companies are also disadvantaged compared to large companies.

Large-scale industrial Mining and Oil and Gas Production

Large-scale industrial Mining and Oil and Gas Production are important to national governments as they rely on them for revenue, taxes and royalties to fund their national budget. Yet their operations destroy and deprive communities of access to land, rivers, and waterways; thereby limiting ASMs' access to lucrative deposits. The communities hardly appreciate the efforts of Mining Companies. This is so because, even when a company provides a social amenity like a school, or health centre for a community under a community development agreement or corporate social responsibility, in effect it is not enough for the communities to replace their livelihood that has been taken.

Examples of severity of the operations of large-scale industrial mining and Oil and Gas Production:

- 50 years of oil spills, pollution of waterways, fires, and gas flares in the Niger Delta of Nigeria hence the violent agitation over the years.
- Burkina Faso is the 5th producer of gold in the continent, yet people live in abject poverty with an estimated 34% of the country's land area degraded by mining, loss of productive land and water.
- Future costs of global warming from EI degradation.

Artisanal & Small-Scale Mining (ASM)

This sector is an important driver of rural economies across West Africa but unfortunately, it also has its severe environmental impact. Illegal bunkering and refining deprive the Niger Delta communities and riggers micro-level environmental impacts.

In summary, the literature shows that environmental damage causes inequality because it deprives already impoverished people of access to their livelihood and makes them poorer and deepens the inequality that exists between rural communities and urban areas and then within their communities.

Does Inequality Cause Environmental Damage?

Literature indicates that inequality & environmental degradation “rise and fall together”. **The more extraction takes place in a community, the more environmental degradation takes place, and the more inequality deepens within the sub-region.** Unlike countries like Norway which have an effective environmental policy and strong institutions to ensure good environmental practice, countries of West Africa don't. In essence, societal inequality breeds and reinforces the likelihood of environmental degradation and so what we should come out of this conference with is that 'Equality is better for the environment'. We should thrive on how we can improve equality to address the issue of inequality.

What is the Relationship Between Inequality and Environmental Degradation and why is it harmful?

This can be looked at from three aspects:

1. **Inequality is strongly associated with poverty:** survival first before good environmental behaviour.
2. **Cyclical effect:** Inequality increases the need for environmentally harmful economic growth. For instance, governments are more skewed towards foreign direct investments rather than environmental policies and protection.
3. **Inequality hampers collective action to protect the environment:** Weak consensus on what to do.

What Mechanisms Exist for Addressing the Impacts of The Extractive Industries on the Environment and Inequality?

1. **Environmental and Social Impact Assessments (ESIAs):** basically, answer several questions:
 - What are the potential environmental & social impacts?
 - How should the company prevent or mitigate them?
 - Can the company prevent or mitigate the impacts?
 - How should the company respond to environmental disasters?
 - Should the project proceed or not?

The challenge with conducting ESIAs in the subregion is that; they are not properly aligned with international standards. **There are also weak social impact governance frameworks for addressing the inequality dimensions. It is cosmetic and tokenism as institutions cannot usually ensure compliance.**

2. **Local Content Policies:** Increase local benefits of resource development (ECOWAS Mining Directive & AMV). **The policy ensures locals are employed, use local goods & services, partner with local entities, improve local skills, improve the capacity of local businesses, and technology transfer.** Companies are to use local resources or a percentage of local resources in their business operations. Deliberate efforts should be made to ensure members in the local communities where extraction is taking place can participate.
3. **Transition to clean energy:** The extractive industries can be looked at from two angles. Industries can contribute to all SDGs (revenues, employment, linkages, green technology) and on the other hand, they can hinder all of the 17 SDGs (degradation, displacement, conflicts, inequality) which have been the case for our subregion.

As a result of the climate change movement, the World Bank has estimated that, the world would need over 3,000,000,000 tons of energy transition minerals by 2050. This will mean more extraction in the sub-region for lithium and cobalt and more mining will mean more impact on environmental degradation. What we need to do then is to take advantage of **climate-smart mining techniques** to reduce impact.

Challenges to Mitigating the Impact of Extractives on Inequality and the Environment

1. Challenges for the Government

- International ESIA framework standards versus national legal and regulatory frameworks.
- Weak institutional capacity to monitor and enforce compliance.
- Weak coordination and collaboration among institutions from national to local
- Focus is on the economy first.

2. Benefits for Companies

- Power asymmetries between large multinational companies (MNCs) and national governments in developing countries.
- Greater power asymmetries between MNCs and local communities.
 - MNCs get away with bad ESG behaviour as a result of the Bilateral Investment Trustees (BITs) between the home countries of MNCs & national governments and the Investor-State dispute settlement (ISDS) system.
- Indigenous extractive industry companies are not exempt from bad ESG behaviours

RECOMMENDATIONS

Start by strengthening the power base of the national governments

- Duty bearers have a role under international human rights law to safeguard the environment and protect citizens
- Identify, review, and renegotiate BITs to include human rights provisions.
- Mainstream the AMV and ECOWAS Mining Development Policy into national laws.
- Consider an AMV and EMDP for the oil & gas industry
- Align the L&R for ESIA frameworks with the IFC-PS and EPs
- Develop a business framework for the ASM sub-sector

Strengthen the capacity and capability base of the national governments

- Strengthen regulatory enforcement power – BIT.
- Consider stand-alone independent regulatory commissions as exist in Ghana and Sierra Leone.
- Collegial approach to ESIA and license approval and monitoring.

Strengthen the Power base of communities

- Build on existing community champions.
- Establish rural community, NGO, environmental activist, and CSO networks.
- Hook up with similar international networks of activists that are tracking the environmental and social performance of MNCs.

9.1. **DISCUSSANT:** Director-General, National Environmental Standards and Regulations Enforcement Agency, Nigeria

Prof. Aliyu Jauro

I want to thank ISODEC for the invitation to contribute to this paper. The paper is apt and touches on the issues within the extractive sector of the ECOWAS sub-region. It is important to have this conversation at this time because we know that the extractives lead to environmental damage which then leads to inequality. There are case studies of the ECOWAS member States on the impact of environmental damage specifically in Zamfara State in Nigeria, where gold mining was associated with lead deposits leading to the death of hundreds of children. Likewise, there are cases in Ghana where lots of farms have been lost due to mining activities. Burkina Faso also has a case with mercury and cyanide pollution which is associated with gold mining.

Based on these cases happening because of extractives, we have asked a key question: Does environmental damage lead to inequality and does inequality lead to environmental damage? Inequalities are associated with poverty and when there is poverty, human beings cannot control themselves as they will always find a means of survival. In this quest to earn a living, the environment is greatly impacted and then the environment comes back to fight us.

So, what then are the challenges that are hampering us from achieving environmental sustainability? The point has been made that the extractives cannot be abandoned as they provide a major source of income for national governments. In Nigeria for instance, 90% of the national revenue comes from the petroleum and mining sector. As discussed by the presenters, **one major problem is the application of the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA)**. Even though most countries within the sub-region have provisions for EIAs, which encompasses social aspects as well, it is not well executed.

There is also the issue of **low cooperation among government ministries and agencies**. For example, in Nigeria, there is the Ministry of Environment responsible for the conduct of the EIA and there is the Ministry of Solid Minerals which is responsible for issuing licenses, but they hardly work together.

The other problem has to do with the **weak institutional capacity for the enforcement of environmental laws**. The agencies are not strong to enforce due to factors like inadequate staff and finance. Another problem has to do with **insecurity**. Most of the areas where artisanal and small-scale mining is taking place are usually associated with a lot of insecurities. Nigeria is dealing with the issue of banditry and militants who operate in these areas making it very difficult for regulatory agencies to have access.

To address these impacts and inequalities associated with extractive industries, there is a need for efficient application and mainstreaming of the environmental impact assessment. Once a project commences there should be periodic environmental audits and adequate sanctions should apply when there are breaches.

There is also the **need to have robust environmental governance which can be done through regular inspection, monitoring and enforcement**. Likewise, there is a strong need for local participation for communities to have a say at all levels of the EIA process. This can be achieved through education, public awareness and sensitization.

3.7 PAPER 2: PROSPECTS FOR ACHIEVING EQUITABLE ENERGY TRANSITIONS IN WEST AFRICA

Dr. Pedi Obani – Associate Professor, University of Bradford, UK

Why Developing Countries?

- The issue of energy poverty is prevalent within the sub-region of West Africa.
- Energy access is very low and when available, has cost implications for the poor and vulnerable population.
- The paradox of climate change. West Africa and other developing countries globally contribute minutely to the greenhouse gas emissions yet are very much exposed and vulnerable to climate change effects.

What exactly do we mean by energy transitions?

It is important to interrogate the meaning of energy transition from the perspective of the West African Sub-region and one may find out that in a sense, this goes down to the root of the equity problem. We need to understand why and what we are transiting and what it implies for the region. The meaning of energy transition is evolving. We largely speak of the energy transition as replacing fossil fuels with renewables and other cleaner forms of energy. Perhaps, a more broad definition could include decarbonisation broadly including carbon offsetting.

The Pace of Transition

In as much as we are aware of the negative environmental, social and economic impact of fossil fuel extraction in the sub-region, we are also aware of the dependencies and so the transition will definitely come at a cost. And so we need to think about how the transition should occur: slow, fast or somewhere in between. The factors to consider can include, the size of the economy and project, infrastructure needs, and economic and social costs.

Drivers of energy transitions.

Humanity has always experienced energy transitions but what has changed over time has been the emphasis on the drivers which are normally closely tied to climate change.

- **Environment:** the environment has been a key driver, especially with climate commitments and minerals for disruptive technologies.
- **Social:** The social driver here is mainly centered on insecurity, cultural practices and processes.
- **Economy:** Here we look at energy costs and compensation for stranded assets. People will always move towards a cheaper form of energy.

Trends in the literature

- There is a shift from low carbon to carbon neutrality or zero-carbon.
- Increasing focus on end-use energy technologies.
- Energy transitions discourse is increasingly linked to climate justice and human rights obligations of States.
- Prospects of leapfrogging are dependent on a wide range of factors including spatial, technological, economic, social, environmental, political and regulatory.

Policy Options:

- **Slow transitions:** This could result in negative externalities, the risk of carbon lock-in, and

creating uncertainties for investment in renewable energy technologies, even if only in the short term.

- **Fast transitions:** Potential implications for the livelihoods and socio-economic and cultural activities of communities that are directly dependent on fossil fuels; implications for the environment where environmental remediation is not prioritized in the transition processes and host communities are left to suffer the long-term environmental impact and historical pollution from fossil fuels production.
- **Combination of slow and fast transitions:** Largely a pragmatic response by many developing countries to avoid carbon lock and through leapfrogging particularly with the adoption of clean end-use devices; also supports a diversification strategy and carbon offsetting across sectors.

Summary & Key Highlights

- Energy transitions ought to address the unique development priorities and the diverse drivers of energy insecurity beyond climate concerns.
- Transitions should prioritise decarbonization through the substitution of fossil fuels and other strategies for carbon offsetting.
- Various energy transition pathways pose differing prospects and risks for developing countries based on their respective contexts and energy assets.
- To achieve equity, we need to think about protecting vulnerable groups from the negative externalities of energy transition pathways.
- A data-driven approach is required to support the optimum mix of regulatory and policy interventions for equitable energy transitions.

3.8 PAPER 3: NATURAL RESOURCES AND EQUITABLE ENERGY TRANSITION IN WEST AFRICA: INSIGHTS FROM GHANA, NIGERIA, SIERRA LEONE, BURKINA FASO, AND SENEGAL

Dr. Eyene Okpanachi - University of South Wales, UK

The Energy Theoretical Frame: Just and Equitable Energy Transition Include:

- **Distributional justice:** Unequal burden sharing of the cost and benefit of energy production and consumption.
- **Recognitional justice:** Recognition of the energy experiences and vulnerabilities of different groups of people, especially the poor, vulnerable or marginalized.
- **Procedural justice:** Democratic participation of different stakeholders in energy decision-making; community ownership.
- **Geopolitical ramifications of energy justice:** The global inequality and external dimensions of energy injustice such as unequal responsibility sharing regarding carbon emissions.

Literature on (West) African energy situation: dimensions of energy poverty and inequality

- Over half of Africa's population (600 million people) lack access to electricity.
- Over 900 million people do not have access to clean cooking.
- West Africa has one of the lowest rates of electricity access in the world. Only about 42% of the total population, and 8% of rural residents, have access to electricity" (Pulti, 2022).
- Wide variation between urban and rural areas' energy access and connection to national grid.
- Electricity access is still very costly and characterized by erratic power supply in many countries.
- Recourse to the use of generators for electricity poses significant environmental, climate and health risks.

Access to Electricity in 2020, Source: <https://data.worldbank.org>

Electricity in the sub-region has been unreliable in large areas, especially in the rural settings that lack access. Ghana has done well in terms of access with 85.9% of the population having access to electricity with 94% being urban dwellers and 74% being rural population. With over 200 million population, only 55.4% have access to electricity in Nigeria. Access to electricity in Sierra Leone and Burkina Faso is 26.2% and 19%.

Electricity Generation Capacity Mix in 2020

Fossil fuels remain the biggest driver of electricity generation in the sub-region except for Sierra Leone which relies heavily on hydro.

Pathways to Energy Transitions

- Increase the share of renewable energy in the national energy mix by enhancing energy capacity through centralized grid connected to renewable projects and increasing decentralized electrification projects to serve off-grid communities.
- Greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions reduction targets, including net zero. Nigeria has a target to become carbon neutral by 2060. Ghana has a goal to increase its renewables by 10% by 2030.
- Use of gas as a transition or 'bridge' fuel to clean energy.
- Transition from a government-dominated energy system to one with multiple stakeholders and public-private partnerships.
- Opportunities for the mining sector: Leveraging critical (green) minerals to support renewable energy development.

Natural resources, energy transition and inequality: issues and challenges

- Exclusion of the people from decisions on energy projects.
- Land use, livelihood issues, and environmental footprints. A current case is in Senegal where community members protested and voiced against a coal-fired plant project in the town of Bargny.
- The natural gas questions. At the moment renewables are not enough to supply West African's growing energy needs.
- The governance challenge of developing critical minerals like cobalt, lithium, manganese is generating
 - Conflict
 - Illegal mining, smuggling and criminal networks
 - Mitigating carbon footprints and environmental pollution
 - Gender dynamics

The Case for the Use of Natural Gas as a 'Transition' Fuel

- Natural gas is much cleaner than fossil fuels, such as coal.
- At the current state, renewables have not yet been developed in Africa to the point that we can rely on them as a secure source of electricity generation. Ogunbiyi and Dayal (2022), state: ***"Today, the world's energy-poor countries, home to nearly half the global population, account for only slightly above 1% of the global wind and solar generation capacity"***.
- New oil and gas finds provide an incentive for the utilization of gas in the sub-region.
- Future energy demands.

Opposition to Fossil Fuel-Powered Energy System

- Use of gas as transition energy locks in countries into fossil fuels development.
- Stranded assets: new finds are a waste of resources as these assets will become worthless sooner.

- Detracts from investment in renewables.
- Natural gas is not a clean energy source as projected.

Summary Questions:

- How do we ensure the proper balance between traditional fuels and renewables in the energy mix?
- How fast can West African countries transition away from fossil-fuel-based power generation without causing energy insecurity disruptions that can worsen the energy problem that the region already faces?
- Should the transition to renewables bypass traditional fuels or be built on them?

My position is that while **West Africa should accelerate its transition to clean energy to ensure more equitable, just and sustainable energy systems, its approach to fossil fuels should also be a strategic one.** Finally, West African civil society has an important role to play to nudge on going toward equitable and sustainable outcomes.

3.8.1 1ST DISCUSSANT– Policy Lead for Petroleum and Conversational Energy - African Centre for Energy Policy

Mr. Kodzo Yaotse

It is important to state that energy transition is something that is already happening and so the discussions on it are imperative. Countries would have to shape the options that are available to them: whether it is going to be slow, or fast or in between. Looking at what is already happening in terms of access to electrical energy, the focus has been transitioning to solar energy and other renewable energy sources. **Though the base input for creating these renewable technologies is found in Africa, they are not produced here and so this has generated equity concerns in terms of who is producing the technologies.** The question now is how do we ensure that African countries do not end up transitioning from fossil fuel to becoming consumers of renewable energy technologies and be dependent in terms of energy security on the producing countries? There is a need for us to start thinking about how to participate in the economics of the transition. We have to leverage on our comparative advantages when it comes to the inputs and engage in cross-border collaboration in manufacturing the technologies.

Moving to another energy access in terms of fuel for transport in Africa, **the conversation has been on transitioning to e-mobility.** The concern here is that since most Africans depend on commercial transport, how do we accelerate in getting electric vehicles on our streets? **We need to build our capacity to be able to design cheaper and more sustainable electronic public transport in a way that ensures equity and justice when we move away from fossil fuels.**

When it comes to fuel for cooking, the push for transition is to move from biofuel to clean cooking technologies (cookstoves and LPG). The challenge here is that the production of these wood fuels serves as a source of livelihood for predominantly rural women and so how do ensure an equitable and just transition if we want everybody to use cleaner energy for cooking? **The other concerns concerning this transition are cost and access, especially for rural folks.** For instance, to motivate people to use LPG in Ghana, the government distributed LPG cylinders to rural folks but since access to nearby retail refilling plants was a challenge to many of them, the program was not successful. And so, these equity concerns should be considered when policies on such energy transitions are developed to ensure people are not worst-off when we transition.

Dr. Steve Manteaw

I will be responding to the question of how we transition in ways that do not create challenges for the existing inequitable society and in the face of the rapidly rising fossil fuel prices and drastically increasing the risk of catastrophic climate. I must say that this is a very interesting topic and the papers did a good job of exploring almost all the trends and patterns of the energy transition. The authors set out by demonstrating a profound understanding of the role of energy in human civilization and show how societal evolution has been inextricably bound with the evolution of energy sources through the ages.



Discussants share various perspective on the presentation

Going by the authors' definition of energy transition, which is a structural shift in the dominant source of fuel for energy production and use, then indeed the world has already been going through transitions. Between 1700 and 1800, the dominant fuel was traditional biofuels, and then between 1800 to 1900 there was a transition to coal and then between 1900 to 2000 we transitioned to oil and gas and now we are making the transition from oil and gas to renewables. In all these transitional phases, one would realize **that the dominant fuel in the previous phase was always prevalent in the next phase of a transition.** For instance, when the world transitioned from biofuels to coal, we did not abandon biofuels entirely and even as we speak, it is still part of the energy mix for most developing societies just as coal still plays a role in the energy mix of countries that have them in abundance. And so as are we talking about transitioning from oil and gas to renewables, I beg to say, **oil and gas will have a role to play in the energy mix going forward.**

Again, the authors argue that, the emerging consensus on the meaning of energy transition as a shift away from fossil fuel is both prescriptive and too narrow to address the differentiated impacts of the shift on various countries in an equitable manner. This view, in my opinion, misses the perspective in the literature that emphasizes deforestation arising in part, from farming and mostly in logging, mining and harvesting of wood fuel as a major contributor to climate change which is what the **Red Flag Framework** set out to reduce emissions and forest degradation.

Two **key points that underpin the current transition are the exhaustibility of fossil fuel and climate change and the contribution fossil fuel makes to this phenomenon.** However, in the paper, we see an almost exclusive focus on the latter, which is climate change. According to the Millennium Alliance for Humanity and Biosphere (MAHB), the world's oil reserves will run out by 2052, natural gas by 2060, and coal by 2090. So clearly whether we believe in climate change or not a time is coming when we

will have no option but to replace our current energy sources and the race has indeed begun. Norway for example is aggressively investing in renewable energy technology even though it continues to exploit its hydrocarbon resources with unabated zeal. Now Norway is on course to becoming the first country in the world to abolish sales of new internal combustion engine cars by 2025.

The oil and gas supermajors are also investing heavily in renewable energy technology while most African countries are in the business-as-usual mode. Looking at the investment Ghana for instance is making with its oil revenues, one will need no convincing that the country is likely to be left behind in this new race. In 2019, the top 15 countries investing in renewables were all outside Africa even though Africa has the greatest renewable energy potential. Africa has made about 5 billion investments out of 366 billion global total between 2011 and 2021, representing a 1.37% share of the global total over the decade.

Now the paper does a good job of exploring the pace and pathways to the transition. It **identifies three main approaches: two extremes, that is business-as-usual or immediate cessation of production of fossil fuel resources. The third is midway, which is a more pragmatic approach that I would recommend for developing countries.** Again, the authors observed a shift in the literature away from the emphasis on low-carbon development towards carbon neutrality or zero-carbon development and pointed out that skeptics see this as limiting the choices of energy sources and their development options available to poor countries. It is important to note that, low-carbon development and the net zero agenda are not mutually exclusive because they both lead to the same destination of reduction in greenhouse-gas emissions. Evidence from most countries' **Nationally Determined Contributions (the NDCs) under the Paris Agreement suggests that most countries are combining rather than opting for one.**

The paper again, explores **the linkages between energy transition, climate justice and human rights obligations of States.** The fact is that the UN framework convention for climate change upholds the principle that no country should be left behind and so decisions made to transition must benefit the most underprivileged. This way, the benefits and burdens of the low-carbon economy are located in accordance with the principle of social equity and apply to both the international and intra-national levels.

To conclude, I want to make a couple of recommendations based on the papers for our consideration. The first point is **a shift away from business-as-usual towards a more proactive energy transition path to ensure that Africa does not miss out on the opportunities** the transition affords, such as timely access to renewable energy technologies. Business-as-usual development will end in an expensive slowly deployed and carbon-heavy power system that makes universal access very difficult and unsustainable.

The second point is important in that **the just transition position finds expression in the continent's transition narrative.** There is the need to consolidate an African position on a just transition.

The third point is that **governments should incentivize technological innovation to scale-up renewable energy solutions** by rewarding novel interventions and providing tax waivers to companies that specialize in research and development of renewable energy and energy efficiency technology.

another point is that **governments should decentralize renewable energy solutions** where a collaborative project can be pursued with industry. Governments for instance, can provide incentives for corporate social investment expenditures in green climate technologies such as small town of off-

grid solutions, liquid biofuels, carbon capture and storage, hydrogen, and offshore technology such as wind farms to complement government efforts.

Finally, there is no doubt that the paper sets the stage for a dispassionate discussion of strategies that will ensure that energy transition does not compound the energy poverty that poor countries suffer already and also worsen the situation of unequal access to power within African societies.

3.8.3 QUESTIONS AND CONTRIBUTIONS

- **One of the issues that have come out strongly from the discussion on the environment and resource governance in relation to inequalities is the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment. It is one of the key issues if well addressed could limit the extent to which extractivism can have on inequalities. Unfortunately, the way the environmental impact assessments are done rarely addresses this problem. We need to understand that the environment itself is a human right concern and people also have the right to development. And so, if we are talking about environmental issues, then we must discuss them within the context of human rights and begin to look at undertaking human rights impact assessment when dealing with extractive activities or energy processes. By this, the real issues of participation, vulnerability, discrimination, empowerment and accountability can be tackled effectively.**

Response:

- *The paper actually looked at the issue of human rights but the fact is that, if you look at the power symmetry between the companies and national governments and then between the companies and the communities and why the companies operate with impunity, you will find out that governments are unable to hold these companies to account because of the Bilateral Investment Treaties (BITs) and then the Investor-State Dispute Settlement (ISDS) system that protect companies from governments to unilaterally changing regulations. And so, **countries in the West-African region need to examine these trade agreements with the mother countries of the companies and then request to inset human-rights provisions as well as Free, Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC) in it. There is also the need to strengthen our national laws and the power-base of governments to be able to deal with of some these human rights issues perpetuated MNCs.***

Question:

- **My contribution is in relation to the issues of environmental protection. Normally, the approach to environmental protection has been top-down. The EPAs grant licenses and determine how the operations of the companies are regulated without much input from the communities. Meanwhile, we know that the best protectors of the environment are the communities. And so, we need to find a way of bringing the communities into the arena of regulation to ensure enforcement. For example, the law that was recently passed last week in Sierra Leone, states that all environmental license conditions and agreements signed between investors and the EPA automatically get incorporated into the agreement between investors and communities. This means that if the EPA refuses to hold a company accountable for any environmental bleaches, the affected community can hold legal action against the company. Finally, if you look at the enormity of the cost involved in the energy sector, there is a need for a shared energy corridor if Africa wants to meet the obligation.**

Response:

- This is a good effort and a step in the right direction, but we also must understand that it is not every lawsuit against the companies that the communities will be successful. For example, in

the Niger Delta, even though the Ogoni people brought a lawsuit against Shell, they only received a fraction of what they demanded. Therefore, we would still need to rely on the government to perform its role as duty bearers under international human rights law.

- The point is that no matter how strong our regulatory institutions are, our governments are weak in terms of the bilateral investment treaties and ISDS which the companies exploit to prevent the government from fulfilling their regulatory rules, so we need to strengthen that foundation first.

Question:

- **My question has to do with electronic waste resulting from PVs as we look at renewable energy. It is estimated that by 2050, there will be about 360 million tonnes of PV waste in our landfills and most of these landfills are sited in areas that are closer to where we experience the inequalities. And so, as we discuss non-renewable energy, how are we linking the discussion of carbon trading and contextualizing what works for us or are we just going with the flow of transition?**

Response:

- *Indeed, electronic waste is already an issue in terms of dumping in many parts of Africa and if you don't have the capacity to address that even when we think about renewables, that will also have implications. And so, **when we think about energy transitions, we must think beyond just the transitions as a value-neutral positive to something that could cause potential damage in terms of waste.** As we generate the policies and infrastructure for the energy transitions to renewable energy, waste and the capacity to deal with it is something we have to think about it. Our ability to deal with our waste in landfills can also bring down greenhouse gas emissions.*

Question:

- **The presenters established a connection between extraction and adverse environmental and livelihood impact. But I am wondering how we can situate environmental remediation and restoration as part of transitional moves. Because for some of the local communities in the extraction site, remediation and restoration of lost livelihood is a key component of transition and transition cannot happen without first restoring what has been destroyed. How can we restore the social and environmental issues in our communities?**

Response:

- *I think an Environment, Social and Governance (ESG) sustainable program can make the companies more accountable because investors and financiers are demanding that companies become more sustainable and protect the physical environment, respect the social structures and then they abide by the national laws of in the countries where they operate. Investors are increasingly applying these non-financial factors as part of their analytic process to identify material risks and growth potentials. The various security and exchange commission and stock exchanges in the world can drive these ESG reforms to ensure that companies in the extractive sector are compliant. This agenda can also be pushed by international activists and civil societies who can monitor the activities and performance of the companies and ensure that their annual reporting to the stock exchanges and financiers is in synchrony with their operations.*

Contributions:

The following were some of the key contributions during the plenary:

- In a sense, the problem is not about the lack of laws and regulations. As a matter of fact, most of the time we have some of the best laws, but **it is about enforcement**. So, whether we call it ESIA or EIA, in a situation where we rely on the companies to tell us whether they have spilled and what constitutes what is spilled and whether they have cleaned up, as far as the government does not have the capacity to go into the field to conduct their independent assessment to determine the extent of damage, then there is a problem.
- Another thing to think of is the structure of the contract. In a situation where the government is partly part of the problem then when we adopt an approach that makes the government a partner to the companies, it also means that when there is a liability then the government should also be held responsible. This will put the government in a difficult situation since they are supposed to be enforcing the law. At the same time, that will mean enforcing the rules against themselves. This has implications on the way we transition

4.0 COUNTRY CASE STUDIES:

4.1 NATURAL RESOURCES AND VIOLENT EXTREMISM IN THE SAHEL AND ON THE AFRICAN WEST COAST, THE CASE OF BURKINA FASO By Mr. Mamadou Karama

(Original Présentation in French)

Overview of Burkina Faso

Burkina Faso occupies an area in West Africa of about 274,200 km² with a population of more than 20 million. The majority of the population are the youth who constitute 77.9% of the population. Islam remains the dominant religion which constitutes 61.6% of the population while Christianity makes up 22.5% with the other religious groups being 15.4%.

Farming and breeding remain the main economic activities in the country. Agriculture has been the key driver of economic growth in the country. Gold is the number one export, followed by cotton. In 2019, gold exports contributed 13.13% of the country's GDP. It should be noted that 43.8% of the population lived below the national poverty line in 2014. The current GDP stands at 988.00 US Dollars.

The natural resources of the country include land, water, forest, wildlife, fish, minerals, and solar. In the context of this study, the **focus will be on forest resources and mining resources because of their close links with terrorism**. There are 76 protected areas (14% of the land area), most of which are located in the eastern, western and southern parts of the country. There are 17 industrial mines in operation with over 400 artisanal and 1500 illegal artisanal gold mining sites as of 2018.

Study Methodology

Data collection for this study included documentary sources as well as demographic, socio-economic and environmental data. Data on the management of natural resources (industrial mines, artisanal gold mining, protected areas) and incidences of conflicts (terrorist attacks and organized crime) were also collected.

History and Expansion of Violent Conflicts

45% of the surface area of Burkina Faso is actively involved in conflicts with attacks constituting 36%, the highest form of conflict. Armed clash involving herder-farmer, inter-community conflicts and large-scale conflict is about 33% occurring mainly in areas where natural resources exist. And so, **natural resources serve as favorable factors for the expansion of violent conflicts in Burkina Faso**.

The reasons are that:

- natural resources are a means of food sources for Armed Terrorist Groups - GAT (wildlife, fish, fruit).
- Natural resources are sources of income generation for the GATs (artisanal gold mining, grazing contract). According to Reuters, the control of several hundred gold sites in Burkina Faso would represent a commercial flow of nearly 2 billion dollars for the benefit of terrorist groups (Reuters Special report, 2019).
- Natural resources are areas of predilection for trafficking of all kinds, the income generated from it makes it possible to maintain jihadism (smuggling of arms, ammunition, gold, cigarettes, drugs, motorcycles, fuel, woodwork, and other prohibited products, robbery, cattle theft, etc.).
- Natural resources are a haven and cache spaces for weapons, other materials and provisions for GATs (camouflage against surprise attacks from tanks, planes, drones, etc.)
- Cross-border/international dimensions of protected areas is an opportunity for terrorist groups (Burkina-Mali-Niger in the North), (Burkina-Côte d'Ivoire-Mali in the West) and (Burkina-Benin-Niger-Togo in the East)

Strategies for Mitigating Violent Conflict

- There is the need to encourage farmers and herders to develop cooperative rather than adversarial relationships;
- The government should put in place a good mechanism for anticipating and effectively managing conflicts;
- Reduce economic and social inequalities between urban and rural areas, including youth unemployment;
- Ensure better control of the gold mining and marketing value chains;
- Finding a solution to land insecurity;
- Eliminate discriminatory practices;
- Develop intra- and inter-religious dialogue (to prevent radicalization);
- ECOWAS should improve security cooperation within the regional corridor;
- Improve the collection, analysis and sharing of intelligence;
- Amend the law and couple the repressive dimension of the law against terrorism with a dialogue approach allowing the reintegration of sons and daughters who want to lay down their arms.

Conclusion and Recommendation:

From its "sahelization", then its "savanization", we are inexorably witnessing a "littoralization" of violent extremism in West Africa. In order to provide an effective response to the expansion of this phenomenon, it is suggested that:

- **At the national level**, link the military response with better management of small-scale conflicts (agro-pastoral conflicts, community conflicts, forestry/artisanal mining conflicts, etc.) and better consideration of the reduction of inequalities in the management of natural resources.
- **At the regional level**, strengthen coordination and harmonization efforts with a view to developing better strategies for governance and equitable management of cross-border natural resources at the level of ECOWAS States.

4.1.1 DISCUSSANT: Hon Emmanuel Bonbande – Conflict Resolution and Peace Activist & Founder of WANEP

The authors presented strong research-based data and evidence that natural resources have been contributing to and sustaining the spread of violent extremism in Burkina Faso. The paper highlighted the cross-border nature of the spread of violent extremism and the activities of Jihadist groups in broader areas where there is a greater concentration of natural resources in abundance. The first thing I want to **highlight is the transhuman's corridors that lead to the forest regions and the trade routes where commercial enterprise has existed over 100 years ago and the co-existence between local**



Figure 1: Mr. Emmanuel Bonbande

agrarians who cultivated the land and the nomadic herdsmen who moved around.

My first observation looking at the Burkina Faso case study which is highlighted in the paper is **the appreciation of how socio-economic marginalization is pronounced across the Sahel and the northern regions of the coastal States of West Africa.** In this respect, we talked about the Peul (or the Fulani) who predominately would end up becoming affiliated with various jihadist and terrorist groups.

Whether this is a reality or perception, this group perceived themselves to have increasingly become dispossessed of their sustainable livelihood by institutional, socio-economic and political arrangements. **The paper presents two broad sustainable systems of livelihood in Burkina Faso, that is the farming communities and nomadic Fulani pastoralists; and the conflicts that have now emerged between these two groups.** And so, the question is, between these two communities who are the more disadvantaged in the interpretations of the ownership of land today? Such a question could be interrogated further to find out how colonialism further impacted the relationship between farmers and herders. In most instances, you hardly hear leaders of ECOWAS talking about these issues until the West talked about it even though it is their colonial administrative structure that has created the marginalization.

The paper presented creates a picture of how 45% of the land surface of Burkina Faso is now actively a terrorist space of activity. This tells us that the authority of the State is non-existent and not firmly on the ground. There is competition between the State and the non-State actors in terms of recruiting, financing and having control over natural resources. The paper further explains how these natural resources finance the activities of these non-State actors. The question is, who will win? Is it the non-State actors that will eventually take over the entire land, or is it the State that is going to reclaim its presence? As we interrogate and appreciate the role of natural resources in financing extremism, it is important to note that the problem is exacerbated by political instability and coup d'états in the Sahel regions. For instance, even though the military claimed that the democratically elected government was not able to fight the terrorist groups hence the staging of a coup d'état in January 2022, more Burkinabes have died and the situation continues to dire as a result of the insurrection by the terrorist groups since Lt. Col. Paul-Henri Sandaogo Damiba took over the reins of power.

The other narrative to this is also the fact that **leaders within the sub-region rarely meet to discuss and find lasting solutions to the problem of insecurity and even if it does, it is at the invitation of the West.** For example, it took the President of France in 2015 to invite President Goodluck Jonathan of Nigeria and President Paul Biya of Cameroon for the first time to talk about the insurgency of Boko Haram and their potential threats to the security of the entire Sub-Saharan Africa and the world. Again, in some instances, even when the initiative to meet comes from our leaders, there is a mentality that is driving division among us. An example is the exclusion of Senegal from the Sahel Strategy of the G5 in fighting terrorism in the Sahel region. And so, to be able to turn things around and stem the situation from deteriorating further, political leaders should be able to cooperate and work together at both national and regional levels and our voices as civil society, academia, and civil service must also rise up.

The other point I want to make is about **the state of stability in relation to the management of natural resources.** The paper points out that, the governance of natural resources should be integral to the political governance of the State. I want to suggest that, **since the terrorist groups take advantage of the small community conflicts especially those between the farmers and herders to find an entry in staging large-scale attacks, the State should be able to respond swiftly through intelligence gathering to prevent small conflicts.** The traditional leaders should also be able to **use traditional mechanisms in resolving communal conflicts** just as the Mogho Naba, the Monarch of Moose group in Burkina Faso, led peace and dialogue talks to avoid a bloodbath between farmers and herders in Ouri community.

Again, the observation is made that as we look at the control of natural resources in relation to inter-communal conflicts and terrorism, it cannot be delinked from the stability of the State of Burkina Faso and the West African Sub-region as a whole.

The next point I want to raise is about **the question of ethnic identity and how we are resolving it.** There is the need to recognize the existence of various ethnic groups especially the minority and the marginalized groups on the basis of their sustainable livelihood and equitable distribution of the benefits of the natural resources.

In conclusion, with the kind of situation that we have on our hands in the sub-region, **it is now very clear that an elected democratic government however challenging it may be, is better in responding to terrorism and creating an environment for good natural resource governance than a military takeover.** Again, when the people elect their governments, they can hold leadership accountable. **Institutional and political reforms' efforts by ECOWAS to get limited terms for elected governments should continue and be supported by all member States.** It is also important to highlight the point that there is a need to promote good neighborhoodness, and harmonize and improve security cooperation at bilateral, regional and African levels.

Questions and Contributions:

- I really saw the eleven-year civil conflict in Sierra Leone that occurred between 1991 to 2002 in the presentation and analysis of the Burkina Faso case study. The then president of Sierra Leone, Ahmad Tejan Kabbah, who was a retired UN diplomat used diplomacy and cooperation as mentioned by Hon. Bombade in bringing the civil war to an end. He identified all the rebel groups: visible, hidden and invincible and through dialogue and cooperation, and together with then President of Nigeria, Sani Abacha, President of Togo, Eyadema Gnassingbe signed a peace accord and agreed on a ceasefire with the rebel leaders. **And so, my question is what has been done in Burkina Faso in trying to identify the powers that be and bringing them to the discussion table in resolving the conflicts?**

Response:

- *About the use of informal channels in dealing with hidden and invincible forces who are behind the various attacks, I might say that beyond the military response, there have been intelligence gathering and other conflict management strategies including using communal dialogue and negotiations. President Christian Kabore used some of these conflict resolution mechanisms to negotiate a deal with the jihadist groups to ensure peaceful elections in 2020. It was unfortunate the military came back to stage a coup in 2022 and things got bad again. But in all, I think it is good to use both military response and dialogue in dealing with the conflict situation.*

Questions:

- The presentation and discussion were top-notch but a scary one. We have been told how the insurgency began in Mali, then in Burkina Faso and now spreading towards the southern part of the sub-region. One of the presentations delivered yesterday also highlighted how the northern part of Ghana is deprived compared to the south in terms of access and equitable distribution of natural resources benefits. And so, **my question is what lessons are we learning from these experiences as civil society, policymakers, and governments to ensure that some of these inequalities don't hang for long, which has a potential to degenerate into conflict and acts of terrorism in Ghana and other parts of West Africa?**
- I think that most of the issues of radicalism, vigilantism, and terrorism that are happening are a result of the inaction of the State in responding to the inequality challenges in a timely manner. And so, in line with the question asked earlier, **I want to ask what our governments are doing in addressing the numerous socio-economic challenges affecting our communities, the youth, and minority groups?**

Response:

- *The question about identity, marginalization and stigmatization is a complicated one. Normally during military operations, certain ethnic groups like the Fulani are targeted but we need to understand that not all of them are involved in jihadist activities. Civil society and NGOs can help with humanitarian assistance and dialogue and create awareness at the community level. The government should also provide support to those who want to lay their arms and be reintegrated back into the community.*
- *Finally, is it not surprising that Burkina Faso is part of ECOWAS, WAMO, G5 Sahel, and the Accra Initiative, yet we have not seen much impact in dealing with the issue and more so since there is much intelligence that suggests that these jihadist groups are now aiming to attack the coastal countries of West Africa especially Ghana. As partners, we should find an effective and better approach to handle the issues.*
- *Part of the challenge is that we assume we are on the right track in dealing with the problem yet in that assumption we see deterioration every day. And so, we need to be very frank with ourselves and begin to have an honest conversation that allows the contribution of all actors particularly civil society to interrogate what is happening and find out why we are not achieving success and what else can be done differently. But as it stands now, in Mali, Guinea and Burkina Faso, the civil society space is being eroded gradually. The implication of this is that, if these spaces are not created, the government won't be better with alternative ideas.*
- *The other point we need to know is that asymmetric wars like what pertained in Burkina Faso where you cannot see the enemy cannot be won with a military response. And so, there is the need to complement the military response with other forms of innovative and creative ways of conflict management. Community participation should be enhanced so community members*

can have an open conversation and talk about their common interests. The State should have a master plan for the distribution of the benefits of the natural resources wealth to bridge the inequality gap at all levels of society.

- *The issue of leadership is also key and it's time we get quality leaders at all levels of our national countries and ECOWAS. We need leaders that can collaborate at bilateral and multilateral levels as Ghana has been doing. For instance, Ghana drives the Accra Initiative which is aimed at preventing the spillover of terrorism from the Sahel and addressing the transnational organized crime and violent extremism in border areas of member countries. We need to elect leaders in our countries and at ECOWAS who have the qualities to push for the necessary reforms that will enhance peace, harmony, and development within the sub-region.*

Question

- There is an article on the Sierra Leone – Liberia conflict that suggests that the elite were incentivized to formalize their operations at the end of the civil war through diamond trading and so the adoption of the Kimberley Process as a resolution mechanism in reducing the diamond conflict. **I want to find out if there were other mechanisms used in ending the war.**

Response:

- *On the question of the Sierra Leone and Liberia diamond conflict, what I can say is that there is nothing that is happening without the geostrategic interest of international actors, both private and government who facilitate the private sector and sometimes rebel groups. And so, it is about power play, and it is about interest and it's about leaders refusing to be selfless. Our government should be able to negotiate better for the good of their citizens of the benefit of the natural resources. There should be a master plan to ensure equitable distribution of the rent. By this we can reduce the widening inequalities and marginalization in our communities and not seek their interest.*

4.2 NIGERIA CASE STUDY: FUELING THE WORLD, FAILING THE PEOPLE; ENERGY POLICIES, ENERGY POVERTY AND ENERGY TRANSITION IN NIGERIA

by Dr. Dauda Garuba – Researcher and Development Practitioner, Nigeria

The parable of the lantern which says;” don’t become light that shines for outsiders while the base is dark” is a reflection of Nigeria’s energy which is fueling the world and failing the people. Energy is the Lifeblood of the modern economy. There have been several transitions, all these transitions were to ensure access to affordable, reliable, sustainable and modern energy which is SDG7.

Nigeria produces 1.6 trillion cubic feet of gas in a year and yet there is a compounding challenge which is energy transition, the way forward is energy mix, value addition/beneficiation and benchmarking the quality of life (targeted subsidy) which will help reduce inequalities.

The Conceptual Framework was on:

- natural resource and energy nexus while looking at other concepts such as policies, poverty & transition
- The types of energy are coal, oil, LNG, hydroelectricity & renewables.

The energy transition decision is about the robustness of policies, demonstrable capacities and financing opportunities. Invariably, they drive at providing availability, reliability, affordability and sustainability and positive interaction between these variables provides energy security while a negative interaction gives rise to energy poverty.

According to OPEC 2001 and PWC 2001, Nigeria is one of the top 10 oil & gas producers in the world and the first in Africa. They produced 3% of OPEC'S 80.4% global oil in 2021 and earned revenue of over \$750 billion from 1999-2020 from producing 37.05 billion barrels of oil and 209.5 trillion cubic feet of gas.

Energy Policy and the Reality of Poverty

There is an updated 102-page energy policy (2003, 2005, 2013, 2018 & April 2022 with 102 p) which emphasizes “**the overall objective of clean, affordable, adequate and reliable energy**” and takes cognizance of PIA2021, new oil discoveries, flaking practices, liberalization of electricity sector, revolution in renewables and climate change-induced decarbonisation drive. There is also a 215-page document on the energy master plan (with detailed policies, objectives and action plan). But Nigeria's biggest problem is the nature of foreign capital; consumption is externally produced, and production is externally consumed and so has no right to determine prices or have no control over prices of what is being produced.

Energy is a major driver of poverty. It does this by:

- Crowding out the impact of other sectors.
- Rising energy prices (oil, LNG and electricity).
- Rising price of goods and services.
- Comatose refineries and the associated impact.
- Russia-Ukraine conflict.
- Under-delivery in the face boom.
- Electricity supply, regulatory uncertainties/enforcement, gas supply, transmission constraints & power sector planning shortfalls.

Energy transition is a reality of a world in motion and people's continual quest for a better life. There are three options for energy transition: **do nothing, join the moving train and pursue a slow and just transition but the way forward as mentioned earlier is to pursue an Energy mix (energy federalism) to arrest high tariffs and cost of living**, value addition and investment in beneficiation which result in jobs and profits and finally establish a benchmark below which citizens must not fall e.g., targeted subsidy of public transportation

4.3 GHANA CASE STUDY: IN WHAT WAY IS GHANA'S MANAGEMENT OF ITS NATURAL RESOURCES EXACERBATING OR HELPING TO REDUCE INEQUALITIES?

Dr. Winfred Nelson – National Development Planning Commission

Scale and Significance of the Extractive Industry

Ghana remained the continent's largest gold producer and the sixth in the world in 2020. About 19% of all direct tax payments and 37% of export revenue are attributable to the mining industry. In terms of Government revenue, minerals account for 45% of total exports, gold contributes almost 95% of mining earnings and is the highest foreign exchange earner and finally, revenue is generated from royalties and income tax from extractive industries and forestry.

A portion of these revenues is used for Social and infrastructural development initiatives in the mining communities. According to Ghana Statistical Service, there have been job opportunities for locals and emigrants including the artisanal and small-scale miners which is 35% of the total gold output in Ghana. Forestry and logging contributed 2% to GDP in 2015, 1.7% in 2016, 1.6% in 2017, 1.5% in 2018, and 13% in 2019.

Natural and Dynamics of Inequality: Highlights

- **Geographical:** In 2013, the difference between the north and south of the country alone was responsible for an additional 10% of national inequality. Poverty issues are quite immense among rural inhabitants than among urban residents, especially in the northern part of the country. Rural-urban disparities account for 17.6% of the country's inequality.
- **Gender:** According to Oxfam, women have limited access to resources such as power, money, property, and other assets, especially under cultural underpinnings.
- **Income:** There are issues with wage levels, working conditions, and labour market policy which differ from place to place and organization to organization.
- **Social:** Some communities have better access to health facilities than others.

Management and Inequality Linkages

The current legal and regulatory regime for mining and forestry in Ghana is reasonably adequate to address the prevailing issues in the industry. **The challenge is not one of the laws but enforcement, including environmental governance, especially with artisanal mining which is dominated by foreigners.**

The issue of inequality has more to do with the expropriation of revenue from mining operations. The application of corporate social responsibility is at the discretion of businesses and other participants in the private sector. It is quite difficult to reconcile expectations and benefit-sharing issues because stakeholders: the government, communities and mining companies, etc. have varied expectations. **Revenue sharing is not proportionally backed with commissionable levels of commitment,** and this aggravates the inequality issues.

For employment, the artisanal small scale-mining forms a large portion of the employment base and so if banded can bring about poverty alleviation.

The increase in unlawful mining has led to the degradation of forests and farmlands, as well as the contamination of water sources, depriving populations near mine operations of vital means of subsistence. A shift of labour from agriculture to other forms of support in the mining areas gives rise to unemployment. Most of these communities are not well resourced to effectively negotiate for better compensation for the loss of their land rights.

The emergence of local content laws versus the development of local capacities and local content law

Recommendations:

- Develop a comprehensive framework for resource extraction and benefit sharing. From the conservationist point of view, the management of natural resources should be considered from the long-term perspective rather than short-term gains considering all cost benefits.
- Studies should be undertaken to explore processes involved in the appropriation of funds as well as the intended and actual benefits to hosting and surrounding communities.
- Establish clear enforcement mechanisms to complement the implementation and monitoring of local content and forest laws.
- We need to cautiously delve into small-scale mining policy because it deals with the alleviation of poverty issues and bridges the gap of inequality.

4.4 A CASE STUDY OF SIERRA LEONE: NATURAL RESOURCE EXTRACTION AND INEQUALITY

by Mr. Sonkita Conteh, Legal Practitioner, Seirra Leone



Sierra Leone passed new laws on land issues to reshape the environmental battleground on 9th August 2022 which is an important division that can address inequalities. The Laws require FPIC by communities and families for all types of investments. Environmental license conditions are automatically incorporated into agreements between companies and communities. Government can set a floor rate as rent but communities are free to

negotiate their own rate and finally no investment in ecologically sensitive areas.

Two days (12th August 2022) after these laws were passed, there was a deadly protest in the country over the rising cost of living where eight police officers and twenty-one protesters were killed. Police stations and a police barracks were burnt down. Unidentified number of vehicles and buses were set on fire and finally, three days dusk to dawn curfew was imposed.

Nature of the Extractive Sector in Sierra Leone

- Similarly, to Ghana, there are huge deposits of gold, diamonds, rutile, bauxite, iron ore, limonite, coltan, platinum, tantalite, zircon and columbite in Sierra Leone but they are not benefiting from them.
- The country has five types of mineral rights: Reconnaissance, Exploration, Large-scale, Small-scale and Artisanal (gold and diamonds)
-
-
- Artisanal mining is exclusively for Sierra Leoneans but there is growing evidence of foreign involvement just as in the case of Ghana and they use sophisticated equipment in their mining. Large and small-scale mining is almost exclusively done by foreign companies. There is no participation by the local people or community members
- Environmental impact assessment and an environmental license are required for large and small-scale mining but how they are enforced is not known.
- In 2021, there were 13 small-scale companies, the majority of which were foreign firms, and 11 large-scale mining firms that exploited 7 distinct minerals.
- Important government institutions are the National Minerals Agency, the Ministry of Mines, the Environment Protection Agency, the Ministry of Finance/National Revenue Authority and the Local Content Agency
- Sierra Leone subscribes to EITI, the Kimberly process and the Africa Mining Vision as well.

Nature of Inequalities

Gini index in Sierra Leone in 2018 was 35.7 representing an increase over 10 years. The Ebola epidemic and Covid situation played a role in the worsening of the position in the Gini coefficient.

To provide an indication of inequality, for every Le 10.000 in 2018 only 16.4% or about Le 1.600 went to the poorest 50% meanwhile, the richest 10% captured 46.2% or about Le 4.600. The Income share of the richest 1% increased by more than 40% between 2011-2018, but the income shares of the bottom 50% declined by more than 5%. Women are most affected by inequality constituting 70% of poor people in the country. The rural areas suffer utmost inequality, but interestingly these are where the resources are found.

Some drivers of inequality

Insufficient tax revenues from mining companies limit government resources for inequality spending. For instance, although the mining industry accounted for 60% of exports (\$200m) in 2010, only 8% of government revenue came from the sector accounting for 1.1% of GDP. Spending habits that are inconsistent do not emphasize reducing inequality. Spending on health, education and social protection has been dismal.

Process and Management of Extraction and Impact on Inequality

Extraction undermines land rights of communities, there are poor enforcement of environmental and other laws and also poor generation and management of extractives revenue.

Policy Reforms for a more Egalitarian Future

There are three major policy changes: Customary Land Rights Act 2022, National Land Commission Act 2022, and Mines and Minerals Development Act 2022:

- Free, prior, and informed consent for all investments
- At least 10% local ownership of all investments
- 10% free carried interest in large-scale mining and up to 35% ownership by the State
- Market-value compensation for loss of crops
- Increased percentage of mining revenue for community development– 0.001% to 1%, new district mining fund- 20% of royalty payments
- Consolidation of tax regime
- Protection of ecologically sensitive areas
- Accrual of surface rent to communities and elimination of artificial pricing of land.

The next major task for Sierra Leoneans is to put these laws into practice and hopefully, other countries can learn from this.

4.4.1 QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS

QUESTIONS:

The common issues that were seen in all three cases were policies, procedures, guidelines, and laws. Usually, there is always a policy conflict when institutions and departments design policies that are supposed to address the inequality but these policies speak alone, so the policies become disenabled -What can we do at the country level to ensure that when we are designing extractive natural resource policies, they are comprehensive, harmonized and aligned in ways that are enabling and can actually address the inequality questions?

Response:

On the topic of policy, in developing policies we should not do it silos but look at what exists, and similar provisions are harmonized. As stated in the Sierra Leone case study, three laws were passed two on land and one on mining. It was deliberate because they wanted a synergy between the laws else if they are passed separately there might be conflicting provisions.

Issues about policies are not forthright but the basic principle is planning with and not planning for and having adequate stakeholder engagement. Those who make the final decision are to be involved from the scratch.

Policy negotiations are also important in all part of the process to effect change. We need to dialogue from the civil society and private sector viewpoint.

Question:

This question is for the Nigerian case study, which was concluded by saying, who are we helping if we transit quickly and then energy mix is preferable? But then, have we considered the fact that a lot of communities from which oil is extracted are no longer having the problem of who we are transiting for and that their communities are faced with the impact of climate change which is a product of burning fossil fuel? So, if we don't transit, we think it saves these communities from the adverse effect of fossil fuel causing climate change, a reason for an emergency transition. The Ghanaian and Sierra Leone case did an analysis on forestry but the Nigerian case did not talk about Nigeria's massive forestry resources and how it is currently being managed.

Response:

When natural resources are up for discussion in Africa, our focus is more on money than governance. Governance is the main issue for us as Africans, God gave us natural resources to make our lives better, but our focus is always on the money, and we leave the latter. When the governance issue is dealt with, there will be no need for communities to transit quickly.

Question:

The cases made mention of the laws as being good to some extent but the problem we face as west Africans is implementation and this has been the problem for a very long time. We must go in that direction, and it is not that the society is not speaking but it is just that this has been politicized so how do we ensure that these laws work especially in Sierra Leone?

From the standpoint of Sierra Leone, artisanal mining is for the natives, who have usually been the poorest. The reason for this is that, by law, they are supposed to benefit from it, but in reality, someone else is taking the big shares. My suggestion is to find a way to support the corporate development of artisanal miners while also providing the government with financial support so that we can reap the rewards.



A participant making contribution

Response:

On implementation, it must be taken to the people. Mostly you think implementation should be done from up to down but if you teach the people what the law is and what their rights and obligations are implementing the law will be effectively done.

Question:

My submission is on Ghana’s artisanal mining. It is said to be 60% of the mining population; how is it going to reflect in the next 20 to 30 years? Is it sustainable, especially the current trend of mining in our country in terms of illegal mining and all other mining activities going on? The youth population has been taken out of the discussions. I request we could articulate the activities of young people in this sector.

Response:

We have a large percentage of the youth as part of the small-scale and artisanal miners. For sustainability, if nothing is done about it in the next 10 years it will worsen. It is about time we sat up and streamlined the issues regarding the whole concept of artisanal mining.

Question:

Yesterday’s last session inspired us to think of what can be done because from what was shared yesterday and today’s three case studies, the challenges, and situations are the same across the West African sub-region. How do we return home and build synergies between organisations at the national level and the subnational levels to create that linkage so that we can influence governance processes and also create a deeper understanding among the people of the available policies and legislation so that people can begin to hold governments accountable? How do we build our own leaders to be accountable in such a way that, they can be able to resist external influences?

Response:

On the issue of harmonization of policies, I believe as a continent we need to find time to collectively engage on some of these issues. And luckily, we have an Africa center representative here to take this up. Normally the policies that are presented at ECOWAS and other groups are different from the policies at our local level. This is an issue, and we need to find a way to deal with it.

4.4.2 CONTRIBUTIONS

Contributions from the plenary that were captured are:

- It is clear we have adequate laws, and they are made to protect the vulnerable. From the lands commission, what is normally done is that if there will be mining on land, what is on the land is assessed and compensation is paid to the owners only if they are able to prove ownership

of the land by providing the relevant documentation for it. CSO supports the government in terms of helping at the grassroots to get documentation for the people to prove ownership of land so they can be compensated. They also make sure what is due them is what is paid to them, especially in the case of resettlement. These are interventions the government has put in place. Finally, CSOs need to support the government to make sure that what is put in the policies are what is really being implemented.

- From the three case studies, I believe there are three problems. Firstly, the political will and objectives of the leaders are different and so there is no connection between the leaders and the followers. Before the discovery of oil in Nigeria, they had Tin and coal, and it sustained the economy. Most infrastructures can be traced to these resources, this is also the case in Ghana during Kame Nkrumah's days as well as in other West African countries. Secondly, we have rich laws and policies especially, in Nigeria but the challenge is we do not own these laws because there is no community involvement, making the execution of these laws difficult. Again, we have an energy distribution problem in Nigeria. Different agencies produce and different agencies distribute and so there is energy stored but not utilized. Lastly, management and negotiation skills should be looked at.

4.5 NORTHERN GHANA EXPERIENCE: DEALING WITH SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC INEQUALITIES IN MINING COMMUNITIES. THE CASE OF NORTHERN GHANA

by Dr. Chrys Anab – TAMA Foundation Interventions

Northern Ghana Overview

The Northern part of Ghana is 54% of Ghana's land size and is made up of 5 geographic regions: Northern region, Upper East, Upper West, Northeast and Savanna Region, which is now the focus in terms of extraction in the mining sector. Northern Ghana's economy is predominately agrarian. According to USAID Northern Ghana feed about 50 million people, contributing significantly to the substitution of US\$ 2 billion in annual food imports.



Dr. Anab of Tama Foundation presents Northern Ghana perspective

Before now, there have been several conflicts in this part of Ghana mainly related to chieftaincy and land conflicts. There is a possibility of violent extremism because of the Burkina Faso border in this zone.

The area is rich in minerals including gold, manganese, iron, limestone, clay, and diamond. The Voltaian basin lies within Northern Ghana which is the best prospect for onshore oil and gas production in Ghana. Since 1997, mining activities have increased in Northern Ghana, both legal (Large scale and Small-scale mining) and illegal (galamsey). Several licenses have been issued.

The Problem

According to Ghana statistical services, 60% of the extremely poor people reside in Northern Ghana.

A few of the challenges are weak community voices and involvement, and limited CSOs mobilisation to address mining issues. Information and data on companies, mining activities, benefits, and related environmental issues are limited.

Different Community Responses to Mining. The community response to mining can be classified as:

- **Radicalists:** They just object to mining and will fight you if you try to mine within their community.
- **Conformists:** Only those with a licence and who abide by the rules are permitted to mine in their communities.
- **Transformationalists:** They believe mining is a game changer and would transform them.

Community Expectations from Mining. These include but not limited to:

- Employment of the citizens of the community
- Community infrastructure development through corporate social responsibility and royalties to the Minerals Development Fund.
- Skills and technology transfer to the citizens
- Enterprise Development, especially for the forward and backward linkages from the mining activities.

Some Voices from the Mining Communities in Northern Ghana has indicated:

- Loss of lives through unannounced blasting of communities
- No transparency and engagement on the part of the mining companies
- Loss of livelihoods for women. The women in the North traditionally lived on harvesting, processing and selling shea; but now they have been displaced and they are not able to pick these shea nuts.
- Community Conflict between the chiefs and the youth of the communities
- Increasing Youth Radicalization

TAMA Foundation Interventions in response to these issues include:

- Capacity building for community leaders on mining laws and policies.
- Capacity building for CSOs and strengthening Northern Ghana CSO Platform for NRG (50 CSOs currently).
- Collaboration with Faculty of Natural Resources and Environment, University for Development Studies (UDS) in research work, conference, and capacity building of community, CSOs and regulatory agencies.

Recommendations

- Increase community engagements.
- Strengthen CSOs' voice in NRG.
- Collaborate with UDS and CSOs to build evidence on NRG, disseminate and advocacy for reforms.
- Promote green jobs for women in mining communities.
- Strengthen community structures to prevent violent extremism.

4.5.1 A CASE OF THE SONGOR LAGOON – A SALT RICH COMMUNITY

Nene Dadebom Anim II -Chief of Salom, Ada West District, Ada Songor Lagoon Association Songor Lagoon.

This report was presented verbatim by the rapporteurs and photos presented during this conference regarding this experience in Songor cannot be presented because of its nature and content.

Songor Lagoon has recently made headlines in the wrong ways. The 158.34 square kilometer Lagoon has been leased to a group headed by Dr. Daniel McKorley, popularly known as McDan, a significant donor to the present administration. The lease is against PNDC law 287's requirement.

From the beginning of time to the construction of the Akosombo dam in the 1960s, every year, the volta River rushes into the lagoon following the main rainy season, which lasts from May through to July. As a result, the Lagoon is overrun with fish and crabs.

The Lagoon typically dries out and leaves behind a flat layer of salt during the dry season, which runs from January to April. The locals in the area are supported economically by the fish in the lagoon during times of floods and by salt during the dry season. The Songor Lagoon basin has a number of sizable towns, villages, and settlements as a result of these economic activities. I am a living example of this. My parents helped me get to this point by fishing and salt-winning in the Lagoon. Because of the Songor Lagoon and its economic operations, there are a number of people who have more knowledge academically than I do, yet as of now, McDan is threatening to stop all Ada residents from fishing, farming, and gathering sea salt in the lagoon.

Around 1972, a company by name, Vacuum Salt Ltd acquired a percentage of the Lagoon to produce sea salt using the vacuum method. It, later turned out that company was using the same method as the indigenes. For the 10 to 12 years that the company operated there, indigenes knew no peace. Vacuum salt claimed they were the only people producing sea salt at Ada, therefore anybody seen dealing in salt was accused of stealing and therefore subjected to beatings and brutalities. It got bad that on the 17th of May 1985 a young pregnant woman by name Margaret Kuwornu was killed by a police bullet. These incidents prompted the setting up of **AMISA Committee of Enquiry**.

One of the outcomes of the enquiry was the promulgation of **the PNDC Law 287. The law calls for the indigenous people and companies that wish to operate to exist side by side**. However, since the declaration of the law nothing material has been done to implement its provisions.

Then unexpectedly in the year 2020, it was announced that the whole of the Songo Lagoon has been ceded to MacDan. The transfer of the Lagoon to MacDan operating in the name of **ElectroChem Ghana Limited** was never discussed with the owners of the property, stakeholders or residents of the area. All we knew was that one-day McDan's Militia, along with soldiers and police, surrounded several of the communities and seized their farms. I happened to be one of the protesters who was repeatedly beaten, brutalized, manhandled, and imprisoned in police cells.

For your information, the company has no EPA permit, has not registered with the local District Assemblies and no community engagement was carried out. In his own Business plan, McDan states categorically that he is going to employ 180 permanent workers and 100 casual workers. He will also prevent the Ada's from engaging in the Songor Lagoon and its economic activities by providing alternative livelihood projects for them. There are about 35000 indigenous salt producers around the Lagoon who are being displaced. In McDan's business plan, he claimed he will sell his salt at a price of 100 dollars per MT and make a profit of 30%. So, his cost of production will be 70 dollars per metric ton. He also said he will be exporting his salt to Nigeria where the salt is landed between 35 dollars per metric ton and 55 dollars per metric ton is surely not profitable.

5.0 HOW DO SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC INEQUALITIES MANIFEST THEMSELVES IN MINING COMMUNITIES AND HOW HAVE COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS CONFRONTED THESE IN WEST AFRICA AND BEYOND?

James Koryor-Publish What You Pay (PWYP)

Africa is home to one-third of all minerals and nearly half of the world's gold. The United Nations estimates that roughly 30% of the world's mineral reserves, 12% of the world's oil, and 8% of the world's natural gas reserves are located in Africa. Nearly 1 billion tonnes of minerals worth \$406 billion were mined on the continent in 2019. The continent is home to 10% of the planet's internal renewable freshwater supply and 65% of the world's arable land.

The primary **issues in West Africa are poor governance, corruption, inequality, and armed conflict.**

Inequalities

Inequality may mean different things to different people and in different contexts. Inequality encompasses distinct yet overlapping economic, social, and spatial dimensions. It refers to the phenomenon of unequal and/or unjust distribution of resources and opportunities among members of a given society. Inequality has reached extreme levels in the region, and today **the wealthiest 1% of West Africans own more than everyone else in the region combined.**

Huge debt amidst inequalities

After Southern Africa and Central Africa, West Africa is the third most unequal region in all of Africa. Poor health care, insufficient employment opportunities, and other issues are primarily attributable to West Africa's growing inequality. Despite the huge wealth the extractive industries hold in the region, we are deeply in debt.

Forms of inequalities

Inequalities are of different forms and as they are pervasive in society, so are they in the extractive sector, particularly in West Africa. They could be political, social, economic, and gender inequalities. For this discussion, we would **focus on social and economic inequality and their causes and manifestations.**

Economic inequality

Economic inequality occurs when resources in each society are distributed unevenly, typically through norms of allocation that engender specific patterns along lines of socially defined categories of persons. It is a concern in almost all countries around the world including West Africa, and often people are trapped in poverty with little chance to climb up the social ladder. It is driven by certain considerations including power, religion, kinship, prestige, race, ethnicity, gender, age, sexual orientation, and class.

Economic inequality manifests in loss of livelihoods and dispossession of lands, violence and conflict, land grabbing, environmental degradation and wage disparities.

Social inequality

Social inequality is **characterized by the existence of unequal opportunities and rewards for different social positions or statuses within a group or society.** It contains structured and recurrent patterns of unequal distributions of goods, wealth, opportunities, rewards, and punishments. **Social inequality is of two forms including inequality of conditions and opportunities.** Inequality of condition is in terms of unequal distribution of income, wealth, material goods, and housing. Inequality of opportunities

relates to unequal distribution of life chances across individuals. It is reflected in measures such as level of education, health status, and treatment by the criminal justice system.

Social inequality manifests potentially by, **corporate capture, child labour, poverty, violence, escalation of gender inequalities, displacements of indigenous settlers and underdevelopment** of host communities.

A community approach to combating social and economic inequalities

Government and non-governmental organisations have worked to address and change the perception of inequality in West Africa, but there is still little cause for celebration in the region's various communities. Communities in the region have developed strategies for grabbing the bull by the horns as a result of the non-governmental organisations' regular training sessions on various development-related concerns. The ultimate goal is for them to escape the poverty that West African society's structural and systemic problems have forced upon them. Several of the methods include:

- **Leverage on legal provisions:** As provided for in the Nigeria Minerals & Mining Act 2007 and in other jurisdictions, host communities leverage on the provision of the Act and agree with companies operating in the community(ies). The agreement is referred to as Community Development Agreement (CDA). The CDA is a social license that enables mining companies to transfer benefits to their host communities.
- **Embrace education:** Communities in West Africa have realised that embracing education or encouraging their children to attend school is one way to escape poverty and end inequality. They understand that education is light and that the darkness of poverty and inequality may be driven away by the light provided by education.
- **Skills acquisition:** different skill sets are required across the extractive value chain, particularly in mining. Community people have recognized this and have given themselves to acquiring skills.
- **Advocacy for fair employment opportunities for locals.** This is especially advantageous to members of the community who are educated or have obtained the necessary skills required by the extractive industry.
- **Synergistic relationship and collaboration with CSOs:** Community people have also latched on to the growing involvement of various CSOs working in the extractive. Together, they have worked to raise their voices and spread the necessary information about the serious problems with extractive governance plaguing the communities.
- **Mobilization:** Communities are also mobilizing themselves by being more organized in terms of taking action to combat all forms of inequality. This has enabled more communities to prepare articulated positions on the peculiar and prevalent forms of inequality faced in their communities.

5.1.1 QUESTIONS AND CONTRIBUTIONS

Question 1:

It was mentioned in the Northern Ghana presentation that a chief sued the community. Did the chief provide any information to lend his side of the story? This is because both sides have a greater understanding of the information. Due to my position in the ministry, I have the honour of handling more than 100 cases of community issues involving mining operations. And I discovered that in some of the earlier highlighted problems, multiple consents seem to be the main points of conflict. Conflicts will arise as one side of the community grants permission to one company while also granting permission to another.

Another problem is high community demand, which is made worse by the companies' lack of transparency. The community is favored in these matters since it provides consent, is entitled to compensation, and qualifies for corporate social responsibility projects.

Response:

In Northern Ghana and most parts of the country, lands belong to the community members, family heads and households. But in the context of this issue, since the chiefs normally hold land in trust for the community, he played a critical role in the engagement of the mining company. But the real landowners were not happy with the terms of the agreements which led to agitation from them and a section of the youth in the community. The chief then felt he had been maligned and his integrity dented in a press conference that was organized by the aggrieved parties and so took legal action against them and as we speak the case is still in court. We are monitoring to see how things will come out in court.

Question 2

The first one relates to the Songor Lagoon case, how are they trying to overcome the media blackouts and the terrorism associated with trying to get the information out?

Response:

I think the shutdown of the radio station is partly due to the decision of the traditional council of which some of us who are even chiefs, have been sidelined. We all know the key role the media, often described as the fourth estate of the realm play in interpreting, and disseminating vital information to the public. Therefore, Radio Ada was just playing its role of letting the indigenes within the Songor Lagoon area whose livelihood depends on the lagoon know the terms of the agreement that was entered between the traditional council and the private investor. And if the paramountcy or traditional council thinks that what they have done is right, then I do not think they should have a problem with the station.

Question 3

We understand that there are also within Ada different factions and tensions and alliances with regard to the struggle. Could you elaborate a little on this?

Response:

It is true that some of us are against the takeover of the entire Songor Lagoon by the private investor not because we are against the development of the area but against the monopoly of the facility and deprivation of community members of their livelihood. Therefore, if a concession is to be given out to an investor, it is only appropriate to engage the very people whose lives depend on it and their concerns considered to avoid some of these troubles in the community. I think there is a law in Ghana (PNDC Law 287) that enjoined the government to hold the Songor Lagoon and its adjoining lands in trust of the people of Ada and so we entreat the government and the traditional council to ensure inclusivity and integrate the interests and concerns of the local stakeholders. As it stands now, the Master Plan and the PNDC law established to guide the mining of salt in the area have been abandoned.

Question 4

How can everybody else help with the struggle?

Response:

We appeal to every well-meaning Ghanaian to come to our aid in making sure that the problem is resolved. As we saw in the presentation, there have been lots of bloody clashes between the irate youth

and the security agencies which have led to brutalities. One can therefore imagine what is going to happen in the next 10 years if nothing is done about the situation.

Question 5

How do women get their stories out? Because I know from experience that when women bring up very serious topics in meetings, they are rejected, and sometimes the men's body language tells it all. There are several incidents, so how serious are the gender issues, and what strategies have we employed to address them?

Response:

In contributing to the feedback, a sister from Nigeria highlighted what we can do to ensure that women's voices are heard. I would say that in Liberia, there is female journalists' association whose work in the media focuses on promoting women's issues. There is also a dedicated newspaper called the "Women Voices" that highlight women's issues daily.

Based on what my Burkinabe colleagues said, one of the things our coalition did was examine the justice system. So, when it comes to the management of natural resources, we adopted a feminist agenda. Building the capacities of women is one of the coalition's hallmark initiatives since the CSOs were having trouble with the gender concept and were neglecting to take these factors into account while planning. Therefore, the initial step was to enhance the coalition's CSOs' capability.

We did case studies, to give some legitimacy to our advocacy and, it is in this direction, that we were able to influence the policies and programs today. If we take the example of our coalition, you can see the significant participation of women. This is the same thing we can replicate in Burkina Faso and in other countries. So, our feminist agenda on the management of natural resources is based on capacity building, advocacy, and justice.

It is quite refreshing to know what civil societies are doing in addressing the issues in the country in terms of tracking how funds are used for community development. This comes as a motivation for civil societies working in Northern Ghana to work harder and do more. I think we can network and collaborate and arrange for cross-border visits to learn and share experiences.

5.1.2 CONTRIBUTIONS:

- The issue of Dollar Power is that with the heavily armed security deployed to the place, one will need permission and must be guarded to the place. And as illegal mining activities become intensified in the area, it becomes a challenge for regulators and key players like the Minerals Commission, Water Resource Commission and EPA to monitor their activities and ensure enforcement. This has serious implications for the safety of people, the environment and water bodies.
- I am a Burkinabe journalist who works in the mining industry. I am a member of an association with an interest in the mining sector. Since Burkina Faso, Senegal, and Guinea have implemented gender projects in the extractive industry and are aware that CSO's advocacy can help overcome obstacles and review government policies and practices. I would like to emphasize the importance of CSOs in the reduction of these inequalities when it comes to the management of mineral resources.
- There are two instances. An organisation like ORCADE in Burkina Faso carried out some work and saw that women were affected differently in rural areas. The NGO worked to eliminate

the disparities because the area's mining sector or firm was impeding the activities of these women.

- The second instance involves a group of women, which is comparable to Burkinabe women in mining. They also realized that the mining sites used for local development did not take gender into account, hence advocacy activities were implemented. Today, Oxfam supports the advocacy, which has expanded to include the sub-region. The advocacy was founded on the already-existing legislation and everything related to decentralisation, and they did everything they could to integrate women. Therefore, there were several laws that supported advocacy. I can thus only conclude that the **CSOs' advocacy work will aid in resolving their issues.**
- In my opinion, it will be crucial to start taking the Human Rights Commission in each of our countries seriously as part of community advocacy so that they can start documenting some of these violations of human rights in the extractive communities and publishing these in their reports. The Constitution requires them to do so. I am aware that Ghana's Human Rights Commission attempted to implement something similar in the past. However, considering the initial report, I am not sure if they attempted to do anything similar again. It will be incredibly beneficial.
- The second piece of advice for CSOs is that, in addition to the tools we already have for community engagement, it will be crucial to step up the work on strategic litigation. Because the examples given, especially in the case of Songor, make it **clear that the media is controlled** by the same cronies who are engaging in this violence alongside State security. I am not surprised that this is not a topic of discussion in the media. Therefore, there is no chance that these reports will appear in the press. Having Pro-bono Attorneys who are willing to sue the State on behalf of the communities is thus one of the best options until CSOs can set up their own media houses.
- I want to know whether we are taking anything away from what is happening. What are we gaining from this, after considering the presentation on Northern Ghana and what we have discovered from Ada's story? For those of us in the northern region of Ghana, where mining and other extraction are starting to occur, the reflection is on how we are preparing for some of the issues. And to consider whether our civic spaces are becoming smaller because, despite our constant talk of inclusivity and the voice of the marginalized population, we are unable to see it in any of the discussions we are having.
- The presentations from yesterday and today have shown us several facts about the nation in which we reside. We heard a presentation this morning on the state of the media, which gave the impression that we have a pluralistic democratic system. However, even in these same countries, there are many things that we all do not know and fate-altering facts that we are oblivious to. Even though I live in the northern part of Ghana, and I am a member of civil society and work in the natural resource industry, the narrative about dollar power was alarming to me. It was also eye-opening to hear the Songor Lagoon story.
- Looking back to the presentation from yesterday, we were also exhorted to assist the government in policing the resource to keep the militants out to mitigate the ensuing insecurities and disputes. What are we going to do when the government is currently aiding the militants in another instance or story? It is obvious from this that our civil societies have a

lot of work to do to feel like we are all citizens of the same country, that we comprehend it, and that we are aware of what is happening in all its parts.

5.2 Chairperson's Closing Remarks – Pauline?

I think what has come out for me is the complexity of the issues, leaving no simple responses. In many of the communities, we still need to unpack the issues. How do we take up the training that has been suggested? How do we make the voices of different actors in the stories heard? I think the presenters have put forward great points. It has been a learning experience, particularly around Ada Songor. This is an issue that power is at play. And I think when it comes to inequalities, power is a factor that is such a huge thing. The power of the elite, and even the power of the State, which sometimes isn't ready to listen as much as it needs to. But it is a very complicated situation. And I think that from here, we are all encouraged to go back and then revisit the issues. Thank you.

6.0 THE MEDIA, SOCIAL JUSTICE AND THE EXTRACTIVE INDUSTRY IN GHANA.

Prof. Kwame Karikari – Executive Director, Media Foundation for West Africa

Introduction

Since the beginning of the conference, we have been provided with a lot of insights about natural resources in relation to inequality but then I have been asking myself: how much of all this wealth of information do our populations in our different countries get to know? In fact, most of our parliamentarians, civil society organizations and chiefs are ignorant about this information. This is because the media are also ignorant of this wealth of information. Is it important for the media to cover the extractive industries because of the central role the extractives play in all our economies and many dimensions of our society's well-being?

The **objective of the paper is to find out how the media in Ghana have tried to report on the extractive industries and whether this report brings out the issue of inequalities** that are associated with the exploitation of natural resources in our country.

Methodology and Analytical Framework

The paper looked at the characteristics of the media in Ghana and the stories in context. The theoretical framework called the “Facilitating role of the media in society including advocacy journalism” was used to test whether the Ghanaian media in reporting on the extractive industries bring out this essential human factor of inequality.

Talking about the Ghanaian media environment, I put it in the context of what Ghanaians and the international community consider Ghana's political system to be. That is, Ghanaians themselves think that their country is democratic and across Africa and elsewhere, many organizations also think Ghana is a democratic society. In this context, we asked the question, **if Ghana is a democratic society, what role do the media play in that kind of democracy?**

The methodology of the study also looked at the content analysis of 5 major media houses to find out how the Ghanaian media cover the issue of inequalities and its ramifications as far as society is concerned. Together, 423 stories were sampled. Interviews were also conducted with the key editors or gatekeepers of these media houses in relation to the findings of the content analysis and why they do what they do with respect to the extractive industry.

Characteristics of the Ghanaian Media

As it is with most African countries, the basic structure of the Ghanaian Media is that there are State-owned media. That is, media that are owned by the State and supposed to engage in public journalism and the commercial sector.

The major State-owned media are the Ghana Broadcasting Corporation and the Daily Graphic newspaper which is the largest and most influential circulated newspaper. Under the constitution of the Fourth Republic of Ghana and by Acts of parliament, these State media are no more controlled by the government and the appointment of their management is done by the National Media Commission, an independent statutory body.

There are nearly 500 radio stations and about 97 privately owned television stations broadcasting around the country. There are also a small but culturally significant community radio system that operate in a number of rural areas. Online media also operate in the country. The operations of most of the online media are basically to aggregate news from existing traditional media houses. Most of the radio and TV stations have their online version as well.

The media in Ghana can be described as pluralistic due to the multiplicity of ownership with much capture of the private sector by the political class, especially by the two major political parties, i.e., the ruling New Patriotic Party (NPP) and opposition National Democratic Party (NDC). For example, one of the media houses used for the content analysis, the Daily Guide Newspaper belongs to a recent former chairman of the NPP. This has a lot of implications for the output of media in this country.

But whether the Ghana media is pluralistic or not, is contestable. A former chairman of the National Media Commission, the statutory regulatory body for the media has said a couple of years ago that, *“Poor people and marginalized groups hardly feature on commercial radio and televisions in Ghana. This means that the poor are visible but unseen and they are present in huge numbers and visible everywhere, but they are neither heard nor seen in the media. The exclusion of the poor and the marginalized undermines the argument that the huge number of broadcasting outlets translate into plurality”*.

Another indicator of an absence of diversity in what the media feed the society has to do with **their marginalization of women in the news and other broadcast program output**. For example, the Media Foundation for West Africa, two years ago, conducted a survey of regular morning talk shows to find out the voices and the presence of women on those radio stations. It studied about 39 major radio stations around the country and they found out that less than 20% of the voices on the morning show programs were the voices of women and less than 10% of the panelists and hosts of the programs were also women. This means that **in terms of gender, there is almost no real diversity in the media content in Ghana**.

Again, **in terms of production, the journalistic output of the media is limited in formats that provide opportunities for dealing effectively with social justice issues**. For example, very few radio or television stations produce documentaries, a format that lends itself to comprehensive treatment of issues of vital public interest. The capacity to produce other features appears to be problematic since not much of each other kinds of programming is regularly published or broadcast. **Investigative reporting, a journalistic activity directly aimed at critical issues such as uncovering wrongdoing by public authorities and exposing threats and attacks on social justice is a type that is most uncommon in the Ghanaian media**. The target of investigative journalists is usually the interest and hidden activities of the powerful in government, business and dangerous elements of the criminal underworld.

Investigative journalists usually pay very high prices, and practitioners in Ghana have not been spared the dangers and threats. As a result of all the factors, the practice of investigative journalism has been declining in journalism in the past decade; in the field, a handful of very vulnerable but courageous crusaders keep battling the criminality of corruption among people in high public office. The country witnessed a murder of an investigative journalist that has not been fully investigated by the Police.

General Environment for the Study

The study was carried out from January 2016 to December 2018 on five media houses:

- **The Daily Graphic Newspaper:** The most circulated and influential newspaper in the country.
- **The Daily Guide Newspaper:** The dailguidenetwork.com platform accounted for the majority (51%) of stories published.
- **Ghana Broadcasting Corporation Online:** The Ghana Broadcasting Corporation is a State-owned national broadcaster with the farthest reach around the country, accessible to all sections of the population in terms of geographical presence and language use. It also is reliable as a source of official news and viewpoint of government.
- **Joy FM:** More prominent and one of the few respected stations mostly patronized by the middle class. It is one of the oldest and a popular private commercial broadcast stations. It is one of the few stations that produces documentaries and other feature programmes that address critical social questions. It has been the pacesetter in the broadcast of investigative reports.
- **Peace FM:** The most popular broadcast station in Ghana; made so widely accessible by its use of the dominant Twi language. It is limited in terms of programming format variety. But it makes up for this with its penchant for audience interaction by phone.

The study period also coincided with the government's campaign on protecting the environment, perhaps, to the most voluble level in the history of Ghana. The first is on sanitation, where the government said it was going to make Accra the cleanest city in Africa and the second is on the fight against illegal mining (commonly known as Galamsey) as a result of their devastating destruction to the environment. The government in its quest to clamp down on these activities which were causing devastating destruction to the environment deployed the military in March 2017 and used all manner of mechanisms to stop the menace. The campaign against illegal mining was massively supported by a coalition of media organizations who felt that the destruction of the environment was too grave.

The five media houses were selected based on the criteria of being the top 10 media houses in Ghana according to a survey by GeoPoll, in terms of coverage and patronage. The sampling of the news stories yielded 423 stories. The stories were assembled with the following keywords to source news published between January 2016 and December 2018:

- Media Coalition
- Galamsey
- Illegal Mining
- Oil and Gas
- Energy
- Extractive Industry

In 2017, 247 stories were published compared to 2016 and 2018 due to the year of the height of the government campaign against galamsey. There was a spike in the number of stories produced in April 2017 that year with 47 stories, which increased to 58 in May and subsequently dropped to 25 in June

of the same year. This could be **attributed to the launch of the Media Coalition Against Galamsey on Tuesday, April 4, 2017** and the subsequent implementation of the coalition's activities.

The study also examined the extent to which the sampled media proactively produced news stories with a focus on the extractive industry. Almost all the 423 stories analyzed were routine stories. Thus, **for every 10 stories analyzed, only one was the result of journalists' initiative**. That is 90% being formal and routine stories. It was observed that 74% of the stories were internally generated, routine stories of work of the media organizations themselves but about a fifth of the stories were sourced from other media organizations.

The study assessed the style of story-telling employed by the sampled media in presenting news about the extractive sector. Almost **all the stories (93.4%) in the extractive sector were told using a straight news format which allows for a basic presentation of the facts of a story rather than an analytical tone that invites the audience to critically assess aspects of it**. Features that afford the use of the analytical tone were hardly employed, constituting only 6.6 percent of the stories.

Findings of the Report

The study reviewed that 20.2% of the sampled stories refer to relevant stakeholders and their specific roles expected of them in the extractive sector. The **stories barely focused on holding the government to account (10.1%), or companies to account (7.7%)**. 2.6% demanded accountability and action from key regulatory bodies such as the Minerals Commission of Ghana.

In respect of the media's role in highlighting issues around licensing, 4.8% of the stories refer to relevant laws about the allocation of resource rights in the country. **3.6% questioned the qualification of contracted companies and less than 1% highlighted conflict of interest in the issuance of licenses, indicating that the media were weak in investigating contracts and other management issues concerning licensing**. As little as 0.4% was observed in terms of the media's scrutiny of the State's participation in the sector.

Collectively, very few that is, 2.4% of the samples media scrutinized the management of revenue from the extractive in the sector. They either questioned the oversight of how revenues are spent (0.9%), provided information on the revenue and expenditure of special funds such as Heritage Fund or reviewed information on revenue-sharing mechanisms and how they are fulfilled, that is 0.6%.

Altogether, 33.1% of the sample media highlighted the impact of the activities within the extractive sector on people, and the environment. They focused, on raising concerns about who is getting jobs from the extraction communities, that's 4.3%. 11.1% highlighted the positive and negative impacts of extractive activities on residents in communities. Of all these stories, the impacts of extraction activities on the marginalized sections of society, i.e., women, the youth, and the aged 3.4% of the stories and 13.8 related to the environment. Only 0.5% of the sample stories related to climate change.

Context of Story

0.5% highlighted signs that the companies were not fulfilling their contract mandate and then 0.6% raised concerns about gender and social inclusion in the award of contracts. A lot of the stories were also on the arrest and prosecution of illegal miners, this constituted 22%. Issues on land and natural resources generally was 13%. 10% on partisan politics and its influence or its implications in the award of contracts. 5% on employment and Labour. Interestingly only 1% had anything to do with health in the context of the extractives and only 1% was also on education. 2% was on water and sanitation as far as the mining activities were concerned.

Implications of the Findings

Some of the findings are directly relevant to the subject of social impact and therefore implicating inequalities relating to issues such as the profile of sources of information to the media, journalist initiatives in generating stories, story format and social groups covered in the news. As indicated earlier, only 10% of stories were generated as a result of journalists' own initiatives. This means that on this critical issue of economic and social relevance to national development, the media hardly take independent initiative in finding information to the public. The media relied mostly on industry representatives, government officials, regulatory agencies and other external sources for material to communicate to the public. This reflects the mindset of dependence on officials as sources of information in the Ghanaian media.

The near absolute dependence on official sources for news and related content may be attributed to the absence of journalists specialized in reporting the sector in media organizations. The complexities of the issues involved in the sector industry are such that it takes specialized study and understanding of the issues for effective reporting and education of the public. **The lack of subject or sector specialization in major sectors of the economy is a common feature of the Ghanaian media profession** even though, since about the 1990s, the World Bank and other agencies have promoted training in reporting the economy and supported the **formation of an economics or business financial journalist association**. For instance, cocoa has been a principal foreign income earner for the country since about the middle of the last century, yet journalists specialized in reporting on cocoa affairs can be counted on one hand, if any at all.

Now, as earlier indicated, most of the stories were of the straight news format. The value of the straight news format of presenting events and occurrences is that it provides the audience with unbiased information about the facts as they are. By presenting information as nearly as objective as possible the journalist affords the audience reliable bases for forming independent understanding and perspectives on those events and issues. But on critical and complex social, economic or political issues however, the media have a responsibility in assisting the public in gaining better or more insights. This is done by providing content formats such as features. **The value of features of various types is that they provide detailed background, analytical interpretation and different perspectives and comments that allow the audience to gain a better and deeper understanding of events and issues covered in the news.** They may also afford an analytical tone by which value judgments may be gathered concerning the social or other meaning or implications of events or issues covered in the media. Only 6.6% of the story sample were types of feature formats. 93.4% with straight news types which means that the media in covering this very critical and complex issue, did very little analysis of what they were reporting to the audience.

Addressing Social impacts

The study found that a third of the stories in the media sampled covered the impact on the environment by extracting activities. This is to be expected because the study covered the period of the government's campaign against illegal mining activities and their impact on environmental destruction. But the study's **findings indict the Ghanaian media has been insensitive to the questions more directly relating to the social implications of the impacts of the activities of the extractive industry**. Only 3.4% of the stories sampled concern marginalized groups in society. **Less than 1% (that is 0.9%) of the story engaged on issues about inequalities such as poverty**. Stories relating to the extractive to health and education accounted for 1% each, while those on water and sanitation took a meager 2.2%. This is not surprising since also, **the profile of sources of information and attribution of voices excluded marginalized citizens such as women and the poor or people in the lowest social classes** such as minors, youth and other residents of the community where extractive activities take place.

The Media attitude to the Poor

There is a current example of **the media's general insensitivity to poor people battling powerful agencies over their rights and interests** in relation to the governance and management of natural resources in the extractive industry. For months now, a long-drawn conflict has been raging between the community members, mostly women miners of salt in the Songor Lagoon and a private business investor allied with the local chiefs to appropriate the industry. Curiously, a major social conflict over the economic livelihood of a community, less than a hundred kilometers from the capital Accra has not attracted the news pages and airwaves of any important media outlet in the country.

The community radio station in the area, Radio Ada has been providing news and information to the community and giving voice to the peasant miners to express their grievances. For upholding its mandate to the community's marginalized, the station and its staff have come under violent attacks by hired thugs without the police arresting the perpetrators. In a manner that betrays the State's duplicitous pretenses about press freedom, the police in an act that suggests the protection of the interest of the rich against the poor, have also arrested and charged to court, a prominent host of a popular program that discusses the issue behind the conflict. The police have charged the radio staff with the crime of publishing false information, a provision in the Public Order Act recently activated from decades of non-use by the police against journalists in Ghana.

What this paper has tried to do is to show the Ghanaian media coverage of the extractive industry. The paper found out that, the media does well in paying attention to broad issues pertaining to the impact of natural resources exploitation on the environment. The media also do well to monitor administrative questions of governance of the sector such as processes of license acquisition and financial accountability with respect to the roles of government and the sector regulatory agencies. **The media's principal shortcoming is in their failure or lack of sensitivity to monitor the socio-economic impact of the industry on the poor and marginalized in society.**

This is a reflection of the Ghana media's general marginalization of the poor and lowest social classes in their normal activities of performing their functions. It derives also from the low attention given to the production of media content formats such as documentaries, investigative reports and other features that provide facilities for in-depth and analytical material. **The only time the media embark on some sort of advocacy journalism, they did so as an appendage of the government campaign against illegal gold mining.** Otherwise, this form of journalistic activity is rarely initiated. When it is undertaken, it is hardly if at all about social justice questions affecting sections of the marginalized in society. The study has shown that the media's coverage of the extractive industry in Ghana dealt with many important issues concerning natural resources management and governance except perhaps the most important and critical human aspect of all.

Recommendations

The media's coverage of the extractive industry indicates that the **principal source of the media's shortcomings is low professional capacity, knowledge and understanding of the political economy of component industries of the sector is weak.** As a result, day-to-day reporting of the sector is often reduced to relaying straight news to the public, the statement and viewpoints of government representatives, and industry officials or on irregular occasions from sources independent of these direct stakeholders. To improve their capacity for more effective and reliable coverage, the following proposals are presented:

- 1. Specialization:** There is the need to institute a training scheme to develop a crop of journalists specialized in the sector with industry players, the company's regulatory agency contributing to the budget and other required resources.

2. **Production of material for regular dissemination:** To promote regular information to the public on the sector, a media production agency may be selected by means of transparent competitive bidding and funded through grants to produce features material for distribution to interested broadcast, print and online news outlets around the region. The production agency shall set up an editorial team to give an editorial guidance to produce documentaries, investigative reports, in-depth interviews and other features for public information and education.

3. **Improving the sector's NGOs and their media relations capacity:** The civil society organizations working in that area should be assisted to improve their media and public relations capacity. Many NGOs and CSOs working in various aspects of the sector's activities produce very worthwhile material that ought to be disseminated to the public. Much of this is not publicized at all or poorly disseminated and if they are presented to the media at all whether as documentation or at press conferences, they are not delivered in forms that make easy use by journalists. The recommendation is **to hold periodic training sessions** to improve the media and public relations capacity of NGOs or CSOs working in the sector.

4. **Media Training Activities:** The media training activities should be focused on well-selected individual journalists or media organizations with proven attitudes for applying new or innovative ideas. Any attempt aimed at wholesale training large numbers of journalists from numerous media houses indiscriminately will end up being a waste of resources. Experience has shown over and over that this approach yields no positive result for media practice or sponsors.

6.1.1 *Contributions and Questions*

- For those of us in the civil society space, the presentation has enlightened our understanding of the workings of the media in the sector. But it is quite worrying to know that only 3.4% of stories concerning the marginalized are self-initiated and published by the media. This tells us that, a lot of the voices of the marginalized and underserved population are not heard. One other aspect I want to bring to the fore is the cost of engaging the media. If you want to engage a media house, especially one that has a national capacity, the amount being charged is often very high and so we need to look at what waiver the media can give to support CSOs in voicing out and addressing issues of the underserved population.

- The media also need to build their capacity in terms of content production. Most of the time, when the media is invited to programs like this, they are not able to sit through to participate and capture the key issues emanating from the discussions. They are only interested in collecting the statements of presenters and publishing them in straight format.

- As indicated, the media supported the Government of Ghana in the campaign against galamsey in 2017 but we hardly hear the media talk about it of late, even though we continue to see the devastating effects of the activities of illegal mining on the environment and water bodies and its impact on the underserved populations. So, the question is, where is the spirit of the media now in keeping with the fight against the menace?

- I am reflecting on a two-day scheduled engagement we will be having with select media in Nigeria in September and I am hoping this analysis would be done with the Nigeria media to enrich the conversation. We need the media to take up initiatives themselves in helping address issues that affect communities. Perhaps this could be a challenge for Dr. Dauda Garuba to take it up in carrying out the analysis.

- I belong to a coalition in Senegal, where we have a good collaboration with journalists as strategic allies, because as you indicated, the extractive industry needs investigative journalists that can adequately report on the impact of extractives in the communities. The CSOs also need the media to share information on the activities that they undertake. And so, I want to find out if the CSOs in Ghana have a platform that engages and brings together the Ghanaian media with respect to the management and governance of natural resources.
- In Nigeria, some of the media houses like **Premium Times** and **The Cable** now have a development sector arm that investigates development issues affecting communities. My question is to find out if there is a law in Ghana that regulate the online media and to ensure that they report independently instead of just aggregating stories from other media houses.
- Apart from the training that has been recommended for the media, what else can be done to build the capacity of the media to take up self-initiatives and advocacy roles because I believe such training programmes are normally provided to them by CSOs, but we still do not see the impact.

Responses

The Law and the Media

- *In Ghana, the law that regulates the media space is very liberal and does not bar anybody from starting any kind of media. The media landscape is mostly captured by politicians who own several media houses. This is mainly so because of government interference in the management of the National Communication Authority, the agency that issues out licenses and releases of frequencies. The online space is hardly regulated and so anybody can start online media unlike in Nigeria for instance, where online media like the Premium Times operates as a full-fledged news organization that reports and produces its own news and materials online.*

Capacity Building for Media

- *With regards to building the capacity of the media, training provided should be focused and **geared towards developing specialists about the sector**, who can write meaningfully, and analytically and ask relevant questions. This can also be done in-house together with the management of the media organization to train the staff so they can be specially assigned to the subject area they have been trained in and report on issues like those that pertained to the extractives.*

Media Relations With CSOs.

- *I am not too sure if there is a direct relationship and engagement between the CSOs and the media. What normally happens is that the media are invited to cover programs and activities organized by CSOs but then they are only interested in receiving a copy of the statements delivered and what the minister invited will say. They hardly sit through the program to listen to the issues that are raised, make contributions and take up the recommendations.*
- *CSOs can also form a coalition to obtain grants to establish production units in some media organization to produce documentary materials, and features on the sector and disseminate them to other media outlets.*
- *I will suggest that to get the media to fully participate and be equipped to report on matters relating to the extractives that affects the marginalized, the media should be invited as in-house*

participants that will stay throughout the duration of the programmes organized by CSOs and not just attendees to programmes.

Quality of Leadership

- *I think we must also look at leadership in our society. What is happening within the sub-region is that **the quality of leadership at all levels in the society (government actors, parliamentarians, academia, traditional and religious leaders) is faltering and gradually going down.** The focus has mainly been on money and personal parochial needs. We need to go back to some of the traditional political ideas that our forefathers used particularly in the colonial period like Pan-Africanism.*
- *Our Pan-Africanism as civil societies, academia, and government actors gathered here for this conference is to **build an organization of networks and develop common strategies that will drive our agenda for change.** For we all know that we cannot depend on our political systems and their leadership to bring in the needed change in the various sectors of our society. **The political class we have today is a perfect reflection of what Dr. Kwame Nkrumah called Neo-colonialism***

7.0 CONFERENCE TAKEAWAYS

7.1 Professor Aliyu Jauro - Director General, National Environmental Standards and Regulations Enforcement Agency, Nigeria

From my perspective to reduce inequality associated with the extractive industries, we must address the issue of environmental impact. One major thing identified, is the conduct of environmental and social impact assessment. We must ensure that it is done effectively. I believe in all our countries; we have sound policies and regulations, but the problem has been the enforcement. We also need to mainstream the African Mining Vision and adopt the ECOWAS mining development policy.

Secondly, we have also listened to Professor Karikari on the contribution of journalists in addressing issues that affect the marginalized in society. The major issue here is corruption! The media are not willing to report the issues of environmental violation until they have received money. Sometimes, the violators have a way of bribing their way out in ways that prevent the media from publishing such stories.

The mining industries should ensure that they abide strictly by environmental regulations. The local communities should be enlightened to know their rights and allowed to participate in the decision-making process of any agreement that affects them and their environment. Likewise, civil society groups should intensify their advocacy role in standing and speaking for affected communities.

Mrs. Georgette Barnes – Women in Mining, Ghana.

I think that over the last few days, we have all realized that governance is key. And I would like to suggest that on the issue of gender, and knowing what happens, what has happened in other West African countries, affirmative action can be the way to go. I believe that this can help in setting the pace from the community to the national level, making sure that women participate in the decision-making processes.

I also have learned that CSOs will need to work together to make an impact as the extractives value chain is really large. And so, I suggest that there should be more training and support for CSOs to collaborate along the extractive sector value chain. And then we also need to see how we can support our people to create value and wealth. I believe that we **need to take advantage of opportunities created along the extracting value chain, by unpacking the activities and analyzing the inputs.** We

need to work on the input starting with cross-industry inputs, looking at the regional market, and creating synergies across the region. This is how we can make people rich and earn money, apart from employment. We also need to look at value addition closely and encourage value addition on all commodities in the region.

Mr. Sonki Conte – Legal Practitioner, Sierra Leone

For the last few days, we have seen how the youth bulge in Africa, a blessing it is as well as a potential time bomb. We have seen what happened in Sierra Leone last week, with many people killed because of protests. We have seen that in Ghana and other places; it means that we do not have the luxury of time at all; we need to address poverty and inequality with urgency. And so, for me, there are two things that I would like to share: The first is that over the last one hundred years, decision-making around natural resource exploitation has been centralized. Governments normally take decisions, and the views of the communities are not taken into account. The reality is that the land where these minerals are found belongs to communities that the government holds in trust for them. So, **we need to change the dynamics by giving free, prior and informed consent from communities for all kinds of investments on their lands.** The consent must be predicated on information! They need to know exactly what the impacts are, and what the benefits are before they will be asked to give consent.

The second thing relates to the environment. The approach to protecting the environment normally has been a top-down approach. We have the EPA that attempts to protect the environment, but they do not because they lack capacity. We have seen how communities are the better stewards of keeping the environment but over the years, they have been excluded from environmental regulation. My suggestion therefore would be that, **when it comes to doing impact assessments, when it comes to determining whether to give or renew licenses of companies, we need to ensure that the communities at stake are part of the regulatory process.** And if possible, we need to empower them to be able to hold the companies accountable for environmental violations.

7.2 Lumun Amanda Feese – Technical Advisor, Strategy & Governance, MinDiver

I am grateful to the organizers for inviting me to be part of this conference. The experience and process have really been impactful, considering the kind of roles that I play back home in Nigeria.

My first point is to agree with Prof. Aliyu Jauro about mainstreaming the AMV and the ECOWAS directive policy in our legal and regulatory frameworks across Africa. But I am wondering whether the AMDC should not consider making this a treaty so that every country is obliged to mainstream these frameworks. I know that there are probably challenges with the many treaties from the AU that have not been mainstreamed but we should probably do more studies on the political economy of these issues and get our countries to mainstream them.

The second suggestion I have is for the countries to **identify the key influential public advisory and advocacy groups that have had some success with working with the governments or advocating for the firms in various sectors.** For instance, in Nigeria, we have the Nigerian Economic Summit Group (NESG), a private sector-led think tank and policy advocacy group. The NESG for the past 27 years, has been working with the government and advising them and pushing for certain reforms. So, I think if other countries have something like this, then that will be helpful for pushing these reforms forward.

My third point is that we **need to do more studies on regulatory enforcement.** We know the conundrum around why our institutions are not able to enforce regulations and identify practical solutions on how to strengthen and make them effective. In our paper, we talked about the bilateral investment treaties, and how it prevents governments from enforcing regulations by international companies. Sometimes too, the problem might be coming from indigenous companies as we have heard about the Ada case on Ghana.

Fourth, we need to support the host mining communities to amplify their voices and help them form associations. **Global Rights in Nigeria has helped the mining communities across Nigeria to form national associations**, and their workings on a network of NGOs and civil societies. There is also the need to expand the concept of NGOs and civil societies in mining to also include those working on human development, education, health, social protection, etc.

Finally, I think it will be good to create a network with civil societies and NGOs in other parts of the world. For instance, in Southern America where most of the issues that affect us in the sub-region and Africa are also eminent in those countries. It will be good to learn and share experiences on what is working and what could be improved. The network could be informed within West Africa, around individual countries in West Africa, in Southern and Eastern Africa and South America, then those in the developed countries.

Mr. Dambe Seyouyi - Senior Regional Coordinator, Francophone West Africa PWYP

We need to document and share all these experiences from civil society because that will help with an evidence-based advocacy campaign. It will be a kind of damage when you are face-to-face with those solutions or decision-makers and you do not have the evidence of what you are suggesting.

We need to **move from resistance to resilience**. As civil society, we should not always think that the “others” are bad people, or their decisions are bad. Sometimes, they take certain decision based on the available information.

The third point is about networking and connection. There is the need to mobilize youth groups, women groups, disabled groups so together we can be stronger. We also need to do more media engagements so that our programmes, interventions and strategies can get to the people that need to know.

More media and social engagements are required. We occasionally produce excellent strategy papers by sharing them; but when others cannot benefit from them, it will not solve the problem.

Finally, we need to put pressure on our governments and decision makers to design and implement concrete, detailed and sometimes budgeted plans of the various policies and regulations that we have in our countries.

Karama Mamadou- Executive Director of AGEREF COMOE, Burkina Faso (Transcribed from French)

On the role of CSOs, the media, and other stakeholders, we generally describe CSOs as minor actors who advocate and exert influence rather than making decisions. Using advocacy as a foundation, for political decision-makers (as I mentioned earlier in my presentation), if we are not cautious, the inequalities will lead to what we are currently experiencing in Burkina Faso, which is violent extremism. We need therefore, to advocate for the various governments in ECOWAS so that we can strengthen the control of the mining sites such that the communities can pursue their activities without becoming a source of conflict. We also need to prevent the inter-communal conflict that causes problems in villages and that is being exploited by terrorists.

When discussing inequality, we need to advocate for the government to implement emergency plans for areas that are disadvantaged so that we can close the gap between different social classes in order to achieve social cohesion and development. In countries where these do not exist, we can set up platforms for dialogues to manage conflicts. We must participate in these as representatives of CSOs, the media, and other interested parties.

Building capacity is a key factor in effectively managing natural resources and reducing inequalities, as has been mentioned by everyone here. Capacity building is beneficial for local political leaders, CSOs, NGOs, and community members alike so that they can gain more knowledge about the extractive industry. As a result, all these individuals should receive training so that they can access information about resource extraction, the revenue generated from it, and the benefits that these communities can receive so that these actors can use the revenue for the development of their communities.

We also believe that the media, journalists, CSOs, and NGOs are the primary actors, but they lack access to information because, in our countries, the mining industries are only the responsibility of governments. We must therefore engage in advocacy so that NGOs, CSOs, and the media in ECOWAS can champion the cause and create a database that will be used to obtain real-time information about the activities of the mining industry for them to make informed decisions.

Finally, in order to minimize inequality through better resource management, we must solicit the support of everyone in the ECOWAS region and replicate whatever we decide in other nations.

7.3 Dr. Winfred Nelson – National Development Planning Commission, Ghana

Making ideas for the preservation of nature and the physical environment is one of the main things the NDPC is obligated to perform. When it is expected that all of the districts are to be developed equally, dealing with natural resources and concerns of inequality becomes essential. Since many people have the misconception that civil society and governments do not collaborate, we are pleased to see that NDPC has teamed with ISODEC on this conference. I think this is the start of something significant, so we need to be encouraged to keep discussing and tackling the problem we are confronted with.

Building the capacity of civil society groups, especially the capacity of the communities, is one of the concerns to consider. It is essential to keep ties between government and civil society organisations in particular. Because of the similar themes that emerged in the discussions, **we need to promote coordination and harmonisation on a regional level so that we can share case studies and present a united front.**

We have talked about common problems, laws and policies, and then mainstreaming. The four basic elements of mainstreaming from the planning commission comprise sections for **planning, budgeting, implementing policies, and monitoring and evaluating** them. **The crack is where we budget and implement, we need to work hard on this in terms of financing and fundraising** so that it will enable us to affect the mainstreaming process with monitoring indicators. Often, we think when we get the issues of natural resources and inequalities into the policy framework, that is the end; but the crack is where we **budget and implement**. Therefore, enforcement is crucial here.

Furthermore, **despite our efforts to promote sustainable development, long-term planning and forecasting continue to be a challenge.** While dealing with these problems, we must consider the long term rather than the short term. We must deal with the issues of inequality and natural resources because they are our problems.

Conclusion By Madam Chairperson Esther Offer-Aboagye – ARHR and Chairperson, ISODEC

We challenged ourselves to bring forth the nexus between natural resources dependent and multiple inequalities and to understand better and contribute to the knowledge of how the two relate and how to enhance equitable and green development through resource management.

We wanted to highlight the policy pathways pertaining to sustainable development goals and other measures that we set ourselves.

Finally, we wanted to stimulate alliances, coalitions and networks on the commitments to addressing inequalities generally and the role of natural resources governance in this endeavor and draw attention to critical interest groups such as women, young people, ethnic minorities, and others. You agree with me that, we have had a flavor of this. I think that we have all contributed to achieving this and we are deeply grateful to all the people who made this conference a huge success. Let us continue the conversation as we go back to our various countries to address the issues that have been raised in the past three days.

8.0 APPENDICES

8.1 Appendix I – Program for the Conference

Day 1: Wednesday August 17 th	Day 2: Thursday August 18 th	Day 3: Friday August 19 th
MORNING SESSION	MORNING SESSION	MORNING SESSION
<p>Session Chair: Dr. Esther Ofei-Aboagye, Chair ISODEC Governing Council & Conference Co-Chair</p> <p>9.00 – 9.45 am Objectives and Logistics Overview</p> <p>of Logistics</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Delegates self-introduction Acknowledgements (Delegates and sponsors) Overview of Conference Objectives and Agenda <p>Session Chairs: Dr. Kodjo Mensah-Abrampa, Director General NDPC & Conference Co-Chair & Dr. Esther Ofei-Aboagye Chair, ISODEC Governing Council & Conference Co-Chair</p> <p>9.45- 10.45 am Official Opening Ceremony</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Opening Statements- United Nations, Ford Foundation, Publish What You Pay (PWYP), African Minerals Development Centre Keynote Address: **Minister for Lands and Natural Resources (TBC) <p>10:45- 11.00 am Health break/Refreshments</p> <p>Session Chair: Dr. Esther Ofei-Aboagye, Chair ISODEC Governing Council</p> <p>11.00-13.00 pm Setting the Scene: The Inequalities and Natural Resource Challenge in West Africa</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Highlights of the Conference Paper & Synthesis of the State of Inequalities and Natural Resource Governance in West Africa (Mr. Charles Abugre) Plenary Discussion 	<p>Session Chair: Mr. Charles Abugre, Executive Director, International Development Economics Associates (IDEAs)</p> <p>8.30-9.00 am– Review business of the day</p> <p>9.00 –10.45 am Economic Governance, Natural Resources, and Inequalities</p> <p><i>“Are Resource dependent economies destined to be unequal?”</i> (Dr. Raymond Frempong)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussants- Prof. Bokpin, University of Ghana Business School & Conference Core team, & Mr. Emmanuel Kuyole, Program Officer Ford Foundation Plenary Discussion <p>10.45-11.00 am Health Break/Refreshments</p> <p>11.00 –13.00 pm Feminist perspective on extractivism in West Africa</p> <p>Session Chair: Beauty Narteh, Ghana Anti-Corruption Coalition</p> <p><i>“Gender justice and extractivism in West Africa. What are feminist groups saying and doing about it?”</i> (Dr. Hibist Kassa & Ms. Iheoma Obibi)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussants – PWYP; Dr. Chichi Aniagolu, Regional Director Ford Foundation Plenary Discussion <p>13.00 – 14.00 pm Lunch Break</p>	<p>Session Chair: Dr. Dauda Garuba</p> <p>8.30 – 9.00 am Recap of Day 2</p> <p>9.00 – 10.30 am Charting next steps</p> <p><i>“A survey of the role of the media in shaping resource governance policies and practices favorable to the reduction of inequalities”.</i> (Prof. Kwame Karikari)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discussant: Ms. Ruth Tene, Investigative Journalist (Nigeria) <p>Session Chair: Ms. Pauline Vande-Pallen, Third World Network & Core Team Member</p> <p><i>“How do social and economic inequalities manifest themselves in mining communities and how have community organizations confronted these in West Africa and beyond”</i> (PWYP & Dr. Chrys Anab, TAMA Foundation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mr. Nene Dadebom Anim, Vice Chair Ada Songor Lagoon Association Discussant/Moderated Plenary <p>10.30-12.00- Health Break & breakout groups on strategy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy gaps Political influencing Community-level justice Gender Justice <p>12.00 –13.00 Plenary report back Session Chair: Conference Co-Chairs 13.00-13.30 Closing panel</p>

13.00 – 14.00 pm Lunch Break		Closing statements
AFTERNOON SESSION	AFTERNOON SESSION	LUNCH
<p>Session Chair: Hon. Engr. Janet Adeyemi, President Women in Mining Nigeria</p> <p>14.00 –15.30pm Political economy of extractivism and inequalities</p> <p><i>“The politics and political economy of natural resource governance: Why do some countries succeed in using natural resources to reduce poverty and inequalities and others don’t?”</i> (Prof. Abdul- Gafaru Abdulai)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussant – Prof. Raymond Atuguba, University of Ghana School of Law • Plenary Discussion <p>15.30 – 16.00 – Health Break/Refreshments</p> <p>16.00 – 17.00 – Wrap up, recap & close for the day</p>	<p>Session Chair: Prof. Samuel J. Cobbina, University for Development Studies</p> <p>14.00–16.00 Environment, energy, and resource governance</p> <p><i>“Extractives, environmental damage, and inequalities in the ECOWAS region: what are the linkages?”</i> (Ms. ‘Lumun Amanda Feese & Dr. Chilenye Nwapi)</p> <p>Discussant- Prof. Aliyu Jauro, Director-General, National Environmental Standards and Regulations Enforcement Agency (Nigeria)</p> <p><i>“How can equitable energy access and transitioning to green energy be achieved in West Africa?”</i> (Dr. Pedi Obani)</p> <p>Discussants: Africa Centre for Energy Policy & Dr. Steve Manteaw</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plenary Discussion <p>16.00 16.30 – Health break/Refreshments</p> <p>Session Chair: Mr. Abu Brima, NMJD (Sierra Leone)</p> <p>16.30-18.00 Country Case Studies (Burkina Faso, Ghana, Nigeria & Sierra Leone)</p> <p><i>“What can we learn from individual countries on the management of natural resources to reduce inequalities in West Africa?”</i> (Mr. Mamadou Karama, Dr. Winfred Nelson, Dr. Dauda Garuba & Mr. Sonkita Conteh)</p> <p>Plenary discussion</p>	

8.2 Appendix II - List of Participants

8.2.1 IN-Country Participants

No.	Name	Institution/ Organisation	Gender	Email Address	Tel
1.	Justice Ofori Elikem	EMPRETEC	M	Elikem811@gmail.com	0240734568
2.	Aaron Atimpe	STAR-Ghana Foundation	M	Aatimpe@starghana.org	0501427444
3.	Esther Ofei-Aboagye	ISODEC	F	eofeiaboagye@yahoo.com	0244706146
4.	Sam Danse	NDA	M	sdanse@gmail.com	0261235700
5.	Grace Owusu	NDA	F	Owusugrace63@gmail.com	0271120335
6.	Paul Owusu Mensah	NDA	M	pauldepea@yahoo.com	0246335439
7.	Kofi Ntim	NDPC	M	Kofi.bugyeintim@ndpc.gov.gh	0501427307
8.	Emmanuel Kuyole	Ford Foundation	M	e.kuyole@fordfoundation.org	024440725
9.	Rosemary Okla	WIM-Gh.	F	rosemaryokla@gmail.com	0243438071
10.	Godfred Asamoah	Water Research Comm.	M	Godfredasamoah19@yahoo.com	0558241209
11.	Solomon Yamoah	SYND	M	Siaw20gh@gmail.com	024514418
12.	Gabriel Sosu	ISODEC/TJC Ghana	M	gsosu@yahoo.com	0248730011
13.	Stephanie Yankson	MLNR	F	stephanieyankson@yahoo.com	024331463
14.	Raymond Atuguba	UGSOL	M	ratuguba@edu.ug.gh	0244354572
15.	Barbara Lartey	NDPC	F	barblartey@yahoo.com	0244877971
16.	David Agbenyega	NDPC	M	david@ndpc.gov.gov	0274440594
17.	David Kodua	NDPC	M	Davidkodua15@gmail.com	0555113641
18.	Sumaila Dauda	MoGCSP	M	Chiroma.gh@gmail.com	0208060003
19.	Samuel Jerry Cobbina	UDS, FNRE	M	scobbina@uds.edu.gh	0504020668
20.	Fati Abigail Abdulai	WOM	F	Womghana2000news@gmail.com	0506549796
21.	Lamnatu Adam	Songtaba	F	lamnatu@songtaba.org	0244203791
22.	Chrys Anab	TAMA Foundation	M	Chrysogonus124@yahoo.com	0244821024
23.	Dr. Agyapomaa Gyekede-Dako	ISODEC/UGBS	F	agyekedako@ug.edu.gh	0268476452
24.	Solomon Ampofo Kusi	FON	M	s.ampofo@fonghana.org	0244055951
25.	Gordon Kofi Sarfo-Adu	FC	M	gsarfoadu@gmail.com	0244286127

26.	Josephine Baddoo	MLNR	F	josebad@yahoo.com	020884548
27.	Rebecca Ayitera	MLNR	F	Ayiterarebecca31@gmail.com	0246699478
28.	Nana Kwame Fosu	GIPC	M	Nana.kwame-fosu@gipc.gov.gh	0246755699
29.	Priscilla Bioh	GIPC	F	Priscilla.bioh@gipc.gov.gh	0203531135
30.	Emmanuel Yeboah	CDD-Ghana	M	e.yeboah@cddgh.org	0542247906
31.	Beauty E. Narteh	GACC	F	bnarteh@gaccgh.org	02440780921
32.	Heartwill Sambah	ISODEC/Tax Justice	F	adsambah@gmail.com	0207793058
33.	Wilfred Ebo Sam Awortwi	NDPC	M	Wilfred.sam-awortwi@ndpc.gov.gh	0207989408
34.	Bernard Anaba	ISODEC	F	bernard@isodec.org/ benabgh@gmail.com	0244584565
35.	Pauline Vanlin Pullin	TWN Africa/ Netright	F	Pupullin@twn.org	0244201612
36.	Bishop Akolgo	ISODEC	M	Bakolgo2000@yahoo.com	020222444
37.	Charles Abugre	IDEAS	M	caabugre@network.org	
38.	Winfred Nelson	NDPC	M	Winfres.nelson@ndpc.gov.gh	0244482407
39.	Fati Lily Soale	MCRA	F	fatisoale@yahoo.co.uk	0208164864
40.	Abdul Gafaru Abdulai	UGBS	M	agabdulai@ug.edu.gh	0208403401
41.	George Owusu	Lands Commission	M	Gerogeowusu922@gmail.com	0206063623
42.	Kwame KariKari	MFWA	M	afumkarikari@gmail.com	0208170991
43.	Ayishatu H. Mohammed	MOF/MEA	F	mohammed@mofep.gov.gh	0241136372
44.	Amponsah-Larbi	NPA	M	Servesamponsh@gmail.com	0200538188
45.	Azanaab Memunatu	ISODEC	F	memunatu@isodec.org	0543845244
46.	Foster Gyamfi	MOF	M	FGyamfi@mofep.gov.gh	0245017967
47.	Martha Baah	ISODEC	F	martha@isodec.org	0204640265
48.	Nii Addo	ISODEC	M	nii@isodec.org	0260704666
49.	Frinjuah Manasseh	ISODEC	M	Frinjuahmanasseh@gmail.com	0244834177
50.	Adam Hudu	IDEAS	M	ahudu@networkideas.org	024999591
51.	Kojo Mensah-Abrampah	NDPC	M		
52.	Steve Manteaw	ISODEC/GHEITI	M	manteawsteve@yahoo.co.uk	0244273006
53.	Francis Delmwini	GSAM/ISODEC	M	fdelmwini@yahoo.com	050104972

				oo.com	
54.	Hui Sowah	Vision Spectra	M	Misow01@gmail.com	0558522255
55.	Emmanuel Edwards	Vision Spectra	M	visionspectrahd@gmail.com	0546272631
56.	Leonard Mensah	Vision Spectra	M	visionspectrahd@gmail.com	
57.	Vicent Ryan Kortey	Vision Spectra	M	visionspectrahd@gmail.com	
58.	Theophilus Adoko	ACEP	M	Theo.adoko@acep.africa	0501379348
59.	Nicholas N. Nuamah	MOF	M		0553809969
60.	Kwadwo Ankomah	ILGS	M		0551562506
61.	Naruin N. Ireland	ACEP	M	nireland@acep.africa	
62.		MEDIA			
63.	Raissa Sambou	Ghanaian Times	F	Raissasabou1@gmail.com	0548997488
64.	Mavis Offei	GTV/GBC	F	Abenaoffei49@gmail.com	0264144338
65.	Betty Arthur	GTV/GBC	F	Abenaoffei49@gmail.com	0264144338
66.	S. O. Koranteng	GTV/GBC	F	Abenaoffei49@gmail.com	0553844493
67.	Issah Mohaunt	GNA	M	Muhiss11@gmail.com	0241319886
68.	Nana Konadu	GRAMHC	M		0501564081
69.	Ben Aii-Martey	UTV	M	Bendoson707@gmail.com	0248361400
70.	Aaron Annan	UTV	M	Aaronannan12@gmail.com	0248361400
71.	Korkor Fiakeye	MOI	F	manyekorkor@yahoo.com	0546755755
72.	Vincent Dzatse	Ghanaian Times	M		0208364224
73.	Ebow Hanson	Daily Graphic	M		0246754819
74.	Ernest Tay Awoosah	ISODEC	M	tay@isodec.org	0208110447

8.2.2 *Out-Country Participants*

OUT-COUNTRY PARTICIPANTS					
1.	Name	Country	Organisation	Gender	Email/no.
2.	Atieno Ndomo	Kenya	Consultant	F	atienondombo@gmail.com
3.	Emmanuel M. Sandi	S. Leone	Ministry of Mines	M	EmmanuelSandi25@gmail.com +23276209010
4.	Ruth Tene	Nigeria	Media	F	Ruthene2310@gmail.com +2348065803417
5.	Emmanuel Yameogo	Burkina Faso	Ministry of Mines	M	yamemma@gmail.com

					+2267041588
6.	C. Amogolu	Nigeria	Ford Foundation	F	c.amogolu@fordfoundation.org +234803384450
7.	Eng. Dr. Janet Adeyemi	Nigeria	Women in Mining	F	jfadeyemi@gmail.com +2348065794162
8.	Demba Seydi	Senegal	PWYP	M	dseydi@pwyp.org +22377445959
9.	Aliyu Jauro	Nigeria	NESREA	M	alijauro@yahoo.com +2348024047191
10.	Ken Henshaw	Nigeria	We The People	M	henshaw@wtp.ngo +2348034055707
11.	Edosa Oviawe	Nigeria	Global Rights	M	edosao@globalrights.org +2348035670173
12.	Mkhuhili Ncube	Ethiopia	AMDC	M	mkhululin@afria-union.org +251977017796
13.	Sonkita Conteh	S. Leone	Namati	M	sonkita@gmail.com +23278717335
14.	Esther Finda Kandeh	S. Leone	Women in Mining	F	estherfindakandeh@yahoo.com +23277886159
15.	Kabore Z. Elie	Burkina Faso	PWYP	M	zeliekabore@yahoo.com 0022670527565
16.	Mohammed Fofana	Sierra Leone	ActionAid	M	m.fofana@actionaid.org 0023278274757
17.	Lumun Amanda Feese	Nigeria	Reseale	F	Lumunfeese@gmail.com 002348066816041
18.	Marieme Mbacke	Senegal	PWYP	F	dadonbacke@yahoo.fr 00221775725442
19.	Dabea Mac-Ileen	Nigeria	Ford Foundation	M	Dma 0023412777100

20.	Dauda Garuba	Nigeria	Researcher/Development Consultant	M	garubadaz@yahoo.com 002348034261150
21.	Emem Okon	Nigeria	Kebatkache Women Centre	F	emembridget@yahoo.com 002348033363172
22.	Chris Ochon	Nigeria	NEITI	M	cochon@neiti.gov.ng 002348033310364
23.	James Koryor	Liberia	PWYP	M	jkoryorpwyp@gmail.com 00231770172157
24.	Abu Brima	Sierra Leone	NMJD	M	abubrima@gmail.com 002327664531
25.	Patrick M. George	Sierra Leone	ACC	M	ngugorgeorge@yahoo.com 0023276747004
26.	Karama Mamadou	Burkina Faso	AGEREF/cl	M	mfkarama@yahoo.fr 0022670260694
27.	Salaam Sallim A.	Nigeria	MMSD/Prog Off	M	Salimade@yahoo.com 002348187209097
28.	Peter Pimpu	S. Leone	NMA	M	pampu@nma.gov.sl 0023278782190

